



EVALUATION OF SAVE THE CHILDREN'S PROMOTION OF BASIC EDUCATION PROJECT IN HAMER WOREDA, SOUTH OMO ZONE OF SNNPR

FINAL REPORT



FOUNTAIN MANAGEMENT CONSULTANCY

26 July 2012

ADDIS ABABA

ETHIOPIA

**EVALUATION OF SAVE THE CHILDREN'S
PROMOTION OF BASIC EDUCATION PROJECT IN
HAMER WOREDA, SOUTH OMO ZONE OF SNNPR**

Submitted to
Save the Children Norway – Ethiopia

Consultants
Befekadu Zeleke (Asst. Pro)
Seleshi Zeleke, PhD

Table of Contents

Content	Page
Table of Contents	3
List of Tables	4
Abbreviations	5
Executive Summary	6
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	13
1.1. Background	13
1.2. Objectives of the Evaluation	13
1.3. Basic Questions of the Evaluation	14
CHAPTER TWO: EVALUATION METHODS	15
2.1. The Study Sites	15
2.2. Data Sources	16
2.3. Data Collection Tools/Methods	17
2.4. Methods of Data Analysis	19
2.5. Ethical Considerations	19
2.6. Procedure	19
CHAPTER THREE: RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	21
3.1. Results	21
3.1.1. Introduction	21
3.1.2. Relevance of the Project	21
3.1.3. Efficiency of the Project	28
3.1.4. Effectiveness of the Project	32
3.1.5. Impact of the Project	50
3.1.6. Sustainability of the Project	56
3.1.7. Status of the 2011-2013 Project	59
3.2. Discussion	62
3.2.1. Relevance of the Project	62
3.2.2. Efficiency of the Project	63
3.2.3. Effectiveness of the Project	64
3.2.4. Impact of the Project	67
3.2.5. Sustainability of the Project	68
CHAPTER FOUR: CHALLENGES AND LESSONS LEARNED	70
4.1. Challenges	70
4.2. Lessons Learned	76
CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	80
5.1. Conclusion	80
5.2. Recommendations	81
References	89
ANNEXES (Annex 1 – Annex 9)	90

List of Tables

Table No.	Table Title	Page
Table 1	Composition of the Sample Respondents by Sex	16
Table 2	Number of Schools and ABE and ECD Centers Before and After SCN-E's Intervention	22
Table 3	Student Enrollment Figures at the End of 2007 (First Project) and at the End of 2010 (Second Project) by Level/Mode of Education and Growth Rate	23
Table 4	South Omo Zone Basic Education GER and NER by Sex and Woreda in 2004 E.C.	24
Table 5	Financial Utilization in the 2008-2010 Project Period	31
Table 6	Constructions Planned and Accomplished by the Project, 2008-2010	33
Table 7	Capacity Building Activities Planned and Accomplished by the Project, 2008-2010	34
Table 8	Distribution of Furniture, Equipment, and Reading Materials: Plan Vs. Accomplishment (2008-2010)	35
Table 9	Community Mobilization and Review Meeting Carried out by the Project	37
Table 10	Improved Student Enrolment due to SCN-E's Intervention	40
Table 11	Pass and Wastage Rates for Students in Grades 1-4 by School and Sex (2001 – 2002 E.C.)	41
Table 12	Pass and Wastage Rates on Grade Eight Regional Examination by School and Sex (2000 – 2002 E.C.)	43
Table 13	Pass Rate and Wastage Rate on Grade Eight Regional Examination by School and Sex (2003 E.C.)	45
Table 14	Performance Scores: Means and Standard Deviations by Grade Level and Subject	47
Table 15	Means and Standard Deviations of Test Scores by Grade, Gender, Location and Origin	49
Table 16	Construction of Schools Planned and Accomplished in 2011	60
Table 17	Capacity Building Activities of the Project in 2011	61
Table 18	Distribution of Materials and School Facilities in 2011	61

Abbreviations

ABE	Alternative Basic Education
AIDS	Acquired Immuno-Deficiency Syndrome
CMC	Centre Management Committee
ECD	Early Childhood Development
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GER	Gross Enrolment Ratio
HIV	Human Immune Virus
HTPs	Harmful Traditional Practices
IED/BCC	Information, Education/Behavior Change Communication
KAP	Knowledge, Attitude and Practice
NER	Net Enrolment Ratio
NGO	Non-Government Organization
PRA	Participatory Rural Appraisal
PTA	Parent -Teacher Association
REB	Region Education Bureau
SCN-E	Save the Children Norway-Ethiopia
SHN	School Health and Nutrition
SNNPR	Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples Region
WEQ	Woreda Education Office
WFO	Woreda Finance Office
WHO	Woreda Health Office
WWCAO	Woreda Women and Children's Affairs Office
ZED	Zone Education Department

Executive Summary

Introduction

Save the Children Norway – Ethiopia (SCN-E) has been working to create and improve access to education for out of school boys and girls in Hamer woreda of South Omo zone of the SNNPR focusing on creating access, piloting Early Childhood Development (ECD), School Health and Nutrition (SHN), and supporting quality of children's learning. More emphasis was given to building the capacities of the woreda education office and school communities and ensuring sustainability of the project.

SCN-E started to operate in the woreda since 2005 in two phases: the first from 2005-2007 while the second was from January 2008 to December 2010. The main purpose of this evaluation is to examine the implementation of the 2008-2010 project and to judge the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the project. Besides, the evaluation will serve as a baseline for the new project which commenced in January 2011 to be implemented until December 2013, paying more attention to the outcome of the project implementation in the second phase.

Evaluation Methods

This evaluative study used both secondary and primary data sources to obtain relevant information. The secondary data sources were project documents, annual reports, and statistics obtained from Hamer WEO and the project office in Dimeka. The primary data were gathered from four of the five cluster of schools in Hamer woreda: Dimeka cluster, Turmi cluster, Erbore cluster and Shanko cluster. Overall, data were collected from 311 participants (children, teachers, facilitators, head teachers, parents, PTA and CMC members, local government officials at woreda level and SCN-E experts) using interviews, FGDs, questionnaire, observation, tests and review of documents. Both quantitative and qualitative methods were used to analyze the data.

Results

Relevance of the Project

The data obtained show that before the project was launched in 2005, there were only five lower primary (Grades 1-4) and two full primary (Grades 1-8) schools as well as two kindergartens. But once the project was launched in 2005, the government has not constructed any new schools or ECD centers. All constructions were made possible because of SCN-E's project. In the 2008-2010 period, the project

constructed 21 ABE centers, eight lower primary schools, one upper primary school, and seven ECD centers.

Similarly, by the time the project reached its completion in 2010, a total of 5018 children were enrolled in the schools which were constructed and supported by SCN-E in Hamer woreda. This enrolment result was achieved through the regular primary schools, ABE centers and ECD centers. Comparing the enrollment figures for each mode of education, one can see that the largest growth rate was registered by ECD centers. The increase from 32 kindergartners at the end of 2007 to 498 at the end of 2010 represents a growth rate of 1556 percent. For ABE centers, the corresponding growth rate is 216 percent. Similarly, student enrollment in formal schools showed a growth rate of 257 percent. Overall, student enrollment grew from 1878 at the end of 2007 (end of the first SCN-E project) to 5018 at the end of 2010 (end of the second SCN-E project). This represents a growth rate of 267 percent in student enrollment.

Efficiency of the Project

Efficiency of the project was judged in terms of time and financial efficiency. In terms of time, although the constructions of several schools and centers were completed on time, several others were delayed. Examples of ECD centers which were not delivered on time include Shanko, Dambaiti and Kaissa ECD centers. The main reason for postponing the completion of activities including constructions was transportation problems during the rainy season. The consultants have witnessed firsthand the transportation challenge during the rainy season. In addition, the financial disbursement procedure employed by the Hamer woreda finance office was a bottleneck that hindered timely completion of planned activities.

In terms of financial efficiency, the total project cost was planned to be Birr 10,871,210. However, the actual expenditure was Birr 22,864,555.90. The difference between the planned budget and the budget that was actually utilized is Birr 11,993,345.90. That is, the actual expenditure was slightly more than twice as much as the planned cost. How did this happen? What were the reasons for spending additional budget? Were there additional constructions? Comparison of the constructions planned and actually accomplished provides at least part of the answers to the above questions. That is, there was a large difference between the planned and the accomplished. For example, although the project planned to construct four lower primary schools, actually nine were constructed. This and similar others explain

why the project's actual expenditure was more than the planned cost. But is this the only explanation we can get? Or is there something else?

In an effort to seek answers to the above questions, we reviewed the 2010 project report which indicates that there was reluctance on the part of Hamer WFO to run financial matters in 2010 and that forced many tasks to be delayed. The rise in the price of construction materials also required additional budget. Information obtained through interviews further confirmed that there were problems in financial disbursement.

Effectiveness of the Project

In order to achieve its objectives, the project focused on four tasks: school construction, capacity building, provisions of facilities and community mobilization. In judging the effectiveness of the project, therefore, the planned activities (targets) were compared with the accomplished activities (or the achieved targets) and level of achievement was determined for each of the planned activities.

In terms of construction, the project has not only achieved its objective fully but has achieved beyond its targets. More specifically, the project has constructed roughly twice as many primary schools, ABE centers and ECD centers as originally planned putting the achievement level at 200 percent or even beyond. It should be reiterated, however, that the project had utilized more budget than was originally planned.

In relation to capacity building, the planned activities were providing training to teachers and facilitators, experience sharing visits, and providing training to mothers on food preparation and providing training to kebele level advocacy team on child rights. The data indicated that the project actually achieved below the target only in two areas: (1) training teachers, WEO staff and facilitators (96.6 percent) and (2) training provided on student centered teaching methods (83.3 percent). In all other areas, the project's level of achievement of its targets was either 100 percent or more.

In addition to improving the manpower capacities, the project has provided the schools and centers with equipment, furniture, reading materials, computers, printers, copy machine, de-worming and trachoma treatment, and medical supplies to schools, among other things. The project has distributed the equipment to the schools and WEO according to its plans (e.g., furniture and equipment, internet equipment, IED/BCC materials and support to REB, ZED and neighboring woredas), more than its plans (e.g., reading materials, stationery for students and the institutions, computers, printers and copy

machines) or slightly below its plans (e.g., de-worming and trachoma treatment and medical supplies and support to Hamer woreda Health Office).

Regarding community mobilization, the project has carried out different activities including sensitizing the community in such areas as the value of education, importance of educating girls, harmful traditional practices, and HIV and AIDS. Concerning participatory community conversation, the data indicate that the project performed beyond its plans. Although the plan was to involve 3000 community members, the actual number of participants was 4880. The only area in which the project performed slightly below its target relates to the training of kebele level advocacy team on child rights.

Other indicators of effectiveness include improvement in enrolment of students and promotion rate. As presented earlier, one significant achievement of the project in the 2008-2010 period is the increase in enrolment of students. Besides, the promotion rates for grade eight students in Hamer woreda as well as for those students in the first cycle (Grades 1-4) were better than the corresponding rates for South Omo Zone and SNNPR. In 2002 E.C., for example, the promotion rate for grade eight students in Hamer woreda was 67.6 percent. The corresponding figures for South Omo Zone and SNNPR (in 2002 E.C.) were 46.6 percent and 54.4 percent. Besides, the promotion rate for students in the first cycle (Grades 1-4) in Hamer woreda in 2001 E.C. was roughly estimated to be 82.9 percent. However, the corresponding rates in the same year for South Omo Zone and SNNPR were 81.9 percent and 75.4 percent, respectively. Thus, the project has performed well in relation to improving student enrolment and promotion rate.

Impact of the Project

In judging the impact of the project, attention was focused on reported changes in views, attitudes, knowledge and practices of the key stakeholders including children, facilitators, teachers, parents and the community at large as a result of SCN-E's intervention.

Regarding impact of the project on children, the children, at least most of them, have better knowledge on several issues including HIV/AIDS, HTPs, and child rights, among other things. This was evidenced by the responses they gave to questions the consultants posed. Children have also started to question practices that they have accepted up until now. For example, siblings have started to say no when their parents decide to give their sister in marriage to an old man. This was something unthinkable in the past.

On the other hand, one of the project's impacts on teachers and facilitators was realized through the capacity building training sessions organized by the project. According to the Hamer WEO representative, many facilitators have been upgraded to certified teachers and this has motivated some of them to pursue their education even further (to a diploma level). Particularly for ECD facilitators who did not have any kind of training or experience in teaching, the project organized a 10-day training session that helped the facilitators to handle the children in a better way.

Regarding the impact of the project on the community, one can raise the fact that the project has improved the community's participation in keeping the schools clean, in fencing the schools, and taking care of plants in the schools' compounds. In some schools, community members have hired guards for the schools, paying salaries through monthly contributions.

Despite the positive impacts described above, many respondents emphasized the fact that the change is slow and the community has not changed much particularly in relation to sending children to school. It should thus be stressed that there are impacts but at the same time the changes are not perfect. Much remains to be done to change the community's attitudes toward the education of girls and elder sons in particular.

Sustainability of the Project

In relation to institutional sustainability, one can observe that all schools and ABE and ECD centers are already functioning under the Hamer WEO. The schools are functioning under the government system and like it does for other government schools, Ministry of Education provides budget to the school in the form of school grant. However, several respondents have expressed their worries on sustainability of the project if SCN-E leaves the woreda.

The fact that no other NGO is working on education in Hamer woreda coupled with the community's unfavorable attitudes toward education are great concerns expressed by several respondents. As a result, many believe that the risk is big if SCN-E stops and leaves right now. All the concerns raised above point to the need for the project staff to work out feasible strategy to convince people that at one point in the future SCN-E will leave and the community shall begin right now to closely follow and support the schools and their children's education. Fortunately, there is sufficient time to accomplish this as SCN-E has commenced another project on improving quality of basic education until the end of 2013.

The Status of the 2011-2013 Project

After completing the 2008-2010 project, SCN-E has commenced another project (2011-2013) under project title “Education quality improvement in Hamer woreda of the South Omo Zone of SNNPR” with the overall goal of helping children develop their full potential. It is nearly a year since the inception of the third phase. Until the end of the third quarter of 2011, the project has carried out construction of schools, capacity building activities including training, experience sharing visits and distribution of materials and equipment.

In connection with construction of schools, the project has accomplished all the activities as per the plan it had for the year 2011. This includes the construction and upgrading of one full primary school, two ECD centers, two ABE centers, and one student hostel. The achievement level was 100 percent and the project has achieved its planned targets on time.

In the area of capacity building, the project conducted experience sharing visits for directors, ABE facilitators, cluster school supervisors, WEO staff and students, and village level community mobilization activities to enhance children’s participation in education. The project has conducted the experience sharing visits as planned for 267 education personnel but it accomplished 85.1% of its targets in relation to village level community mobilization. In another dimension of capacity building, the project has distributed materials (e.g., exercise books, pens, pencils, solid waste disposal) to students with a 100 percent level of achievement of targets or better.

Conclusion

In light of the number of schools available in Hamer Woreda before SCN-E’s intervention as well as the number of students attending school, the project’s plans and achievements were highly relevant to the needs of the pastoralist communities in Hamer Woreda. Unlike its relevance, the project was efficient in some aspects but not in others. Whereas the project has completed several of the planned activities as per the original schedule, it could not finish and deliver some constructions on time. In terms of financial utilization, the project has spent a significant portion of the budget on construction.

The project was found to be effective because it has accomplished most of its planned activities including constructions, capacity building, and provision of equipment and furniture. Some of the

activities were accomplished according to plan (that is, with 100 percent level of achievement). In some cases, the project has accomplished beyond its targets.

In relation to impact of the project, the evaluation revealed multifaceted changes in terms of knowledge, attitudes, and behaviors of the key stakeholders. Because the community is predominantly pastoralist and considers modern education as a threat to the pastoralist culture and tradition, most parents are reluctant to send especially their elder son and daughters to school. However, one cannot deny that there are positive changes in the community's perceptions or attitudes though slow.

Finally, regarding sustainability, one encouraging feature of the project is that the schools and ECD and ABE centers are functioning already under the Hamer WEO. Besides, the project has continued its third phase focusing on general education quality. This will continue until 2013 and there would be relatively enough time to develop exit strategy that would prepare the stakeholders well ahead of time in owning and sustaining the project's ideals and the impacts which came about because of the project. However, sustainability of the project and its impacts in the long run require much more work in changing the perceptions of the pastoralist communities.

Recommendations

The recommendations we put forth are discussed in detail in the report. In brief, they include suggestions

- to improve wastage (dropout and repetition) rates as well as enrolment rates,
- to improve quality of education through training that should be provided to teachers and facilitators as well as provision of educational materials including textbooks,
- to improve the quality of the learning environment through improving the library service and improving teacher's handling of students and classroom management through provision of training,
- to change attitudes of the communities in Hamer woreda through sensitization programs utilizing culturally influential people as change agents.

In addressing these issues, all concerned bodies should work together. In each case, the role that should be played by SCN-E and Hammer WEO as well as the South Omo ZED and SNNPR Education Bureau are specifically indicated in the report.

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background

Although the introduction of modern education in Ethiopia dates back to 1908 when Emperor Menelik II opened the first school in Addis Ababa, the provision of basic education in remote and peripheries is still a challenge to the government. Particularly, children in the pastoral areas are deprived of the service for many years in the past. The Ethiopian government in collaboration with donors is putting maximum effort to avert the situation particularly in remote and pastoral areas and improve children's access to basic education. Save the Children Norway-Ethiopia (SCN-E) is among several non-governmental organizations working to make basic education accessible to disadvantaged and marginalized children such as children of pastoralist communities in Ethiopia.

In partnership with Hamer Woreda Education Office (WEO), SCN-E has been working to create access to education for out of school boys and girls in Hamer woreda of South Omo zone of the SNNP regional state focusing on creating access, piloting Early Childhood Development (ECD), School Health and Nutrition (SHN), and supporting quality of children's learning. More emphasis was given to building the capacities of the woreda education office and school communities and ensuring sustainability of the project. The project started to operate in the woreda since 2000 in two phases: the first from 2000-2007 while the second was from January 2008 to December 2010. Hence, the main purpose of this evaluation is to examine the status of the project and see the changes observed on the children and communities of the target woreda. Besides, the evaluation will serve as a baseline for the new project undertaken as of January 2011 to be implemented until December 2013, paying more attention to the outcome of the project implementation in the second phase.

1.2. Objectives of the Evaluation

The main objectives of this evaluation were the following.

- To quantitatively and qualitatively illustrate the status of the intended changes in the target communities and evidently illustrate outcomes of the project.
- To assess changes that occurred by virtue of the project implementation in the integrated sub-thematic areas and cross-cutting issues proposed in the document.

- To assess changes and outcomes as per the stated objectives and strategies of the project
- Recommend action points and lessons of the good practices for future interventions

1.3. Basic Questions of the Evaluation

Based on the objectives and key areas of focus of this evaluation stated in the Terms of Reference, the following basic questions were formulated to guide this evaluation.

1. To what extent did the project create access to basic education for Hamer pastoralists in the woreda?
2. To what extent did the project contribute to improve quality of basic education provided for Hamer pastoralists in the woreda by improving the inputs, throughput and output of basic education? Or what are the different efforts/contributions of the project to improve the quality of basic education in terms of the educational inputs, through puts and outputs?
3. To what extent did the project create equity in basic education for Hamer woreda children by improving urban vs. rural and gender parities?
4. What are the different capacity building activities carried out by the project for different stakeholders in the woreda?
5. What are the different policies and strategies of the government specific to education and pastoralist development addressed, utilized, rolled out to the local government by the project? What are the specific challenges affecting pastoral children's learning, particularly girls in schools?

CHAPTER TWO

EVALUATION METHODS

This evaluation was conducted using Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA). Given the large area of land Hamer woreda covers and the relatively short period of time (that is, 10 days) allotted for data collection, it was necessary to employ a method that is flexible enough to permit several but simple data collection tools (such as semi-structured interview, questionnaire, FGD and observation) and a combination of qualitative and quantitative methods (that include simple statistical analysis such as means, standard deviations, percentages, correlations, and t tests) of data analysis. More importantly, PRA requires full participation of the rural communities to share their opinions, knowledge and experience to the consultants who are outsiders. Furthermore, the data that would be collected are not only in-depth and adequate but are also dependable for they are collected from different groups of stakeholders using several tools that make triangulation possible (Bhandari, 2003).

The methods employed in this evaluation are presented below under different sections. These include study sites, study participants and sampling techniques, instruments that were used to collect data, procedure, data analysis methods and ethical considerations.

2.1. The Study Sites

The evaluation was conducted in Hamer Woreda of the South Omo Zone, Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples Region (SNNPR). As the list of schools in Hamer woreda (see Annex 10) show, there are 19 primary schools and one secondary school in the woreda. The 19 primary schools in the woreda are grouped in five clusters: Dimeka, Erbore, Kara, Shanko and Turmi clusters. Data for the present evaluation were collected from four of the five clusters. The only cluster excluded was Kara. It was left out for fear that not only transportation would be difficult because of rain but there was also risk of flooding.

The consultants visited and collected data from Dimeka Primary School, Enbule primary school, Erbore Primary School, Erbore ECD Center, Cherkoka Primary School, Cherkoka ECD Center, Gonderba ABE Center, Shanko Primary School, Shanko ECD Center, Turmi Primary School, Turmi ECD Center, Boriya Primary School, and Boriya ECD Center. On the whole, data were collected from seven primary schools, five ECD centers, and one ABE center. The schools were selected using convenience sampling

technique. The main aim was to collect adequate data from schools that were not affected by the untimely rain which created inconvenience in transportation. Besides, it was impossible to reach some of the schools (e.g., in Kara and some remote places) because of risks of flash flooding during the fieldwork.

2.2. Data Sources

This evaluative study used both secondary and primary data sources to obtain relevant information. The secondary data sources were project documents, annual reports, and statistics obtained from the Woreda Education Office (WEO) and from the project office.

The primary data were gathered from primary school children, from those who study in ABE centers, teachers, ABE facilitators, ECD facilitators, head teachers, parents, PTA and CMC members, local government officials at woreda level and SCN-E experts. Table 1 shows composition of the respondents who were selected from the different groups of stakeholders.

Table 1. Composition of the Sample Respondents by Sex

Participant	Female	Male	Total
Parents/PTA members	4	15	19
Teachers/Facilitators/Head Teachers	19	31	50
Students (Tested)	53	84	153 *
Students (FGD and Case Story)	38	46	84
Woreda Level Officials + SCN-E Staff	0	7	7
Total	114	183	313 *

* The sums 153 and 313 are greater than the sum of the number of males and females because 16 students who took the tests did not specify their sex.

The tests were administered in Dimeka (semi-urban) and Erbore (rural) Primary Schools with a view to examining rural-“urban” differences. In Dimeka Primary School, there are two sections in grade four and two sections in grade five. One section from each grade was selected randomly and all students in each section (51 students in Grade 4 and 50 students in Grade 5) took the tests. However, in Erbore Primary School, because students who were present on the test date were small in number, all of the

students (23 students in Grade 4 and 29 students in Grade 5) took the test (that is, availability sampling technique was employed). Thus, although the consultants initially planned to employ random sampling technique in selecting the students to whom the tests were administered, this was actually done only in one of the schools (that is, Dimeka Primary School). As indicated above, availability sampling technique was employed in selecting the students in the second school (that is, Erbore Primary School).

In selecting all the other groups of respondents who participated in the FGDs and in the interviews, purposive sampling technique was used. This technique was used so as to focus on those stakeholders who would provide us with pertinent and rich information about the project. Communication skills and how well the respondents know the project were used as the main criteria for selecting respondents. This was done with the help of teachers in each school.

2.3. Data Collection Tools/Methods

The consultants employed questionnaire, semi-structured interview guide, focus-group discussion guide, observation checklist, and tests to collect primary data for the evaluation. Besides, review of documents provided secondary data. Each data gathering tool is described below.

Questionnaire

The questionnaire was administered to teachers, facilitators and head teachers. It included both open- and close-ended items. The questionnaire also contained rating scales comprising items that require respondents to rate the multifaceted contributions of the project in Hamer woreda. The items generally pertain to the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the Hamer Pastoralist Basic Education Project (2008 – 2010). The scale was developed by the consultants for the purpose of this evaluation. Furthermore, the questionnaire contained items that aimed to explore the opinions of teachers regarding the training they received, relevance and appropriateness of the training contents to their work, as well as opinions on areas of improvement or impact of the project.

Semi-Structured Interview

Semi-structured interview guide was developed and used to obtain data from different interviewees: head teachers, facilitators, woreda level officials, and SCN-E staff. The interview guide dealt with several issues including relevance, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the project. Other issues addressed by the interview guide included harmful traditional practices, how the pastoralist community

values education in general and the education of girls in particular, and major challenges and suggested actions for improvement.

Focus Group Discussion (FGD)

The FGD guide was used to facilitate the discussion held with students, parents, and PTA members. In each school where FGD was conducted, female and male students participated in separate discussion groups. The FGD guide was developed to gather information on issues pertaining, among other things, to enrolment of students in the project schools, attendance, dropout, facilities and basic services, children's participation, impact of the project on children, and changes in children's knowledge, attitudes and behavior as a result of the project.

Observation Checklists

Two observation checklists were developed to collect data through direct observation. One of the checklists aimed at evaluating teaching effectiveness through classroom observation. The second checklist was prepared to check and record the absence or presence of facilities (e.g., classroom furniture, sanitary facilities, store, and play ground) in each school. For example, the presence or absence of latrine in each school and whether there are separate latrines for boys and girls were recorded using the checklist.

Tests

The consultants developed a mathematics test for students in grade four and mathematics and Basic Integrated Science Tests for students in grade five based on the textbook for each subject. The tests were designed to examine the students' level of academic performance.

The mathematics tests for grade four and grade five contained 25 items each. The Basic Integrated Science test for grade five comprised 20 items. In developing items, attempts were made to make the items representative of each textbook both in content and difficulty level. In other words, the tests have content validity.

Document Review

In addition to primary data, secondary data were gathered from documents. In particular, annual reports, general inventory report for the period 2008 – 2010, Education Quality Improvement Project document for the period 2011 – 2013, and the 2011 annual report were reviewed.

2.4. Methods of Data Analysis

The data collected for the evaluation through the tools described above were quantitative and qualitative. More specifically, the qualitative data were obtained through the interviews, focus group discussions and review of documents. On the other hand, the data collected through the questionnaires and the three tests were chiefly quantitative.

After reading the responses obtained through the tools, the qualitative data were coded and categorized into classes of pertinent themes. The data were then analyzed by examining the expressions of the respondents and by determining emerging similarities and differences among the responses of the participants for each category. The results were then written using descriptions that reflect the mix of different responses.

On the other hand, the data that were gathered through the questionnaire and tests were entered into the SPSS software for quantitative data analysis. The data were then analyzed using appropriate statistical techniques including descriptive and inferential statistics: frequencies, percentages, means, standard deviations, and inferential statistical tests. Particularly inferential statistical tests were used to analyze group differences (e.g., differences in academic performance between male and female students, differences in test performance due to location of the school). These group differences were examined using t test.

2.5. Ethical Considerations

The evaluation was conducted in a way that meets ethical standards. First, the researchers clearly communicated the purpose of the study to the respondents. The consultants then informed the respondents that (1) participation is fully based on their willingness, (2) the data would be used only for the purpose of the evaluative study, and (3) information would be used without the name of the respondents attached to it (that is, under anonymity). Overall, therefore, the respondents were informed about their rights not to participate in the study and they participated only because they agreed to do so.

2.6. Procedure

After signing an agreement with the client, relevant documents for the evaluation were collected and reviewed. Then, the consultants developed data gathering tools and submitted them to the client for comments and further refinement. After the final data collection tools were prepared incorporating

comments, the consultants conducted the fieldwork. In each school, two teachers were recruited with the help of the head teacher to serve as assistants. Before they begin their role as a moderator of FGDs or as interviewers, they received a short training on the instruments and on how to conduct FGDs and interviews as well as on how to record the data. They were asked to read the items of the FGD and interview guides and to raise any doubts they might have about the items. The consultants urged the assistants to record (in writing) any information provided by the participants verbatim whenever possible regardless of its perceived values for the evaluation.

CHAPTER THREE

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1. Results

3.1.1. Introduction

This evaluation attempts to accomplish two linked but fairly distinct purposes. As its first task, the study will present an overall evaluation of the 2008-2010 project through a detailed examination of the project's relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. Because a new project (2011–2013) has already been launched before the conduct of the present evaluation, it may not seem appropriate to examine its sustainability. However, the focus of the 2011-2013 project is on the provision of quality basic education to children in Hamer woreda rather than creating access to children of the same woreda. One can therefore say something on sustainability as well. The second task of this evaluation is to examine the status of the 2011-2013 project with a view to providing baseline data for the purpose of assessing changes from the baseline to the end of the project. The findings and discussion will therefore be presented accordingly.

3.1.2. Relevance of the Project (2008-2010)

The community in Hamer woreda is predominantly pastoralist. In pastoralist communities, modern education is seen as a threat to or as something that degrades/disgraces pastoralist culture and tradition. Supporting this idea and explaining the reason why pastoralist communities specifically in Hamer have such a perception, SCN-E project coordinator working at Hamer WEO told us the following.

I was born and grew up in Hamer. The condition of children's education before 2005 was worrisome. The number of students in Hamer woreda as a whole was 961 only. Pastoralist communities in Hamer fear that their children would leave them if they send them to towns to attend school. For this reason, they don't send their children to school.

At present, unlike the past, parents send their children to school. In relation to this, one PTA member in Shanko kebele had the following to say.

Because of the school constructed here, our children get the chance to attend school. Our past may be considered as living in the wilderness. The community is now sending children. However, this requires working on community members and sensitizing them on the benefits of education.

Similarly, a PTA member who participated in the FGD conducted at Dimeka Primary School stated his opinion as follows.

The main contribution of the project is creating access to those children who are in rural areas through constructing schools, employing teachers, and supporting them with textbooks. Had it not been for the schools, many children would not have been in school.

The preceding excerpts clearly show that the project has addressed the needs of children by constructing schools in Hamer woreda where there were only few schools. But how many schools were there before the project and how many were there at the end of 2010 when the project was completed? The data that will help us to answer this question are shown in Table 2 below.

Table 2. Number of Schools and ABE and ECD Centers Before and After SCN-E's Intervention

Year	Constructed by	ABE	Primary 1-4	Primary 1-8	ECD
2004 (Before SCN-E's Intervention)	Government	0	5	2	2 KGs
2007	SCN-E	16	2	2	6
2008	SCN-E	8	4	1	3
2009	SCN-E	8	3	-	2
2010	SCN-E	5	1	-	2
2011	SCN-E	1	1	-	2
TOTAL		38	16	5	17

(Source: Project Annual Report, 2010)

The data in Table 2 clearly show that before the project was launched in 2005, there were only five lower primary (Grades 1-4) and two full primary (Grades 1-8) schools as well as two kindergartens. But once the project was launched in 2005, the government has not constructed any new schools or ECD centers. All constructions were made possible because of SCN-E's project. Focusing only on the second project period (2008-2010), one can observe from Table 2 that the project constructed 21 ABE centers, eight lower primary schools, one upper primary school, and seven ECD centers.

As shown in Table 3 below, a total of 5018 (3713 boys and 1305 girls) children were enrolled in the schools which were constructed and supported by SCN-E in Hamer woreda by the time the project reached its completion in 2010. This result was possible not only through the regular primary schools but also through the ABE centers and the ECD centers.

Comparing the enrollment figures for each mode of education, one can see that the largest growth rate was registered by ECD centers. The increase from 32 kindergartners at the end of 2007 to 498 at the end of 2010 represents a growth rate of 1556 percent. For ABE centers, the corresponding growth rate is 216 percent. Similarly, student enrollment in formal schools showed a growth rate of 257 percent. Overall, student enrollment grew from 1878 at the end of 2007 (end of the first SCN-E project) to 5018 at the end of 2010 (end of the second SCN-E project). This represents a growth rate of 267 percent in student enrollment.

Table 3. Student Enrollment Figures at the End of 2007 (First Project) and at the End of 2010 (Second Project) by Level/Mode of Education and Growth Rate

Level/Mode of Education	End of 2007	End of 2010	Growth Rate (in %)
Formal Schools (Grades 1-8)	1120	2883	257
ABE Centers	758	1637	216
ECD Centers	32	498	1556
Total Enrollment	1878	5018	267

(Source: Project Annual Report, 2010)

The data in Table 3 above generally show that the project has done well in terms of increasing student enrolment during the project period (2008 – 2010). But one can also compare what the project in Hamer woreda has achieved in terms of GER and NER relative to other woredas in South Omo Zone. It can also be compared with the Zone average. The data are shown in Table 4 below. The data show that Hamer woreda has done well in terms of GER for males although this is less than the corresponding GER for each woreda in South Omo Zone included in the table. The data very clearly tell that neither the GER nor the NER for females was good. The GER and NER pertaining to female students in Hamer woreda are not only less than those for the other woredas in South Omo Zone, they are also very small.

Table 4. South Omo Zone Basic Education GER and NER by Sex and Woreda in 2004 E.C.

Name of the Woreda	GER			NER		
	M	F	T	M	F	T
South Ari	160.7	144.7	152.7	77.73	68.52	73.1
Salamago	239.3	177	208.5	75.01	59.7	67.41
Male	168.7	164.7	166.7	97.19	97.96	97.58
Benatsemay	162.3	128.8	145.8	48.66	41.24	45.07
Hamer	122.1	37.88	80.93	35.03	13.5	24.74
Dasenech	220.8	190.8	206.2	42.14	36.33	39.4
Gnangatom	264.1	306.5	284.7	47.47	55.01	51.05
Zone Average	180.4	151.9	166.3	76.24	65.16	70.78

Source: South Omo Zone Education Department

Focusing on the NER only, one can see that among the school age children for the level (Grades 1-8), 35.03 percent of the boys and only 13.5 percent of the girls in Hamer woreda were attending school in 2004 E.C. Compared to the NER for each of the other woredas and the zone average, the ratio for Hamer woreda is the smallest for both boys and girls. Both the ratios for boys and girls are very small but definitely the NER for boys is far larger than the one for girls. Had it not been for SCN-E's project, one can imagine how bad the condition could have looked. Thus, in terms of NER in particular, Hamer woreda is lagging behind all other woredas included in this analysis. This implies that many more school age children are not attending school and this requires much more work to mobilize the community.

A further dimension that makes the project relevant is reflected in the community's awareness which was improved a great deal due to the project's intervention. That is to say, because the communities are predominantly pastoralist, it is not customary for them to send their children to school. However, the consultants' observations and data obtained through interviews and FGDs indicated that parents, though not all, are sending their children to school and the number of parents doing this has increased every year. Their attitudes toward the education of children have been changing albeit slowly. The consultants have observed, for example, a mother accompanying her child to Turmi Primary School in the morning as shown in one of the photographs included in this report. Despite these positive changes in parents' attitudes in places like Turmi and Dimeka, which are small towns, parents in rural kebeles, at least most

of them, are not equally keen to send or accompany their children to school. In other words, even though there are positive changes in parental attitudes and awareness in relation to the value of children's education in some small towns, similar changes cannot be observed among parents in rural kebeles, suggesting that much more effort should be exerted to change the communities in rural kebeles.

Apart from examining the number of students who are enrolled in the schools, it would be informative to see the number of classes and the average class size. The latest data we obtained from Hamer WEO indicate that at the end of the 2004 E.C., the number of students enrolled in primary schools (Grades 1-8) was 2870 (1988 males and 882 females). These students were attending their studies in 100 classrooms (number of classes or sections). Based on these data, one can observe that the average class size in 2004 E.C. was about 29. This means that on average about 29 primary school students were learning in one classroom in Hamer woreda.

Similarly, there were 1666 (1437 males and 229 females) students in ABE centers. There were 101 classrooms in the ABE centers. Thus, in relation to ABE centers and the children who were studying in the centers, the average class size in 2004 E.C. was about 17. That is, in 2004 E.C. about 17 children were studying in one classroom of the ABE centers in Hamer woreda. Considering the average class size for both the primary schools (29) and the ABE centers (17), one can observe that the average class sizes in both cases were small. In other words, both the primary schools and ABE centers can serve many more children than was the case in 2004 E.C.

Moreover, the relevance of the project may be seen from the perspective of addressing the Government's policies and strategies. In this regard, the increase in students' enrollment because of the project and the initiative taken by SCN-E to improve quality of education are good examples where the projects' accomplishments intersect with the governments' policies and strategies.

(A) Enrollment

The data presented in Table 2 above show that the project has constructed primary schools, ECD centers and ABE centers in an effort to improve access and enrolment of children. Table 3 shows the enrolment of students in 2010. But how do the stakeholders feel about this increase in students' enrollment? Do different people perceive the increase in the same way?

According to FGDs conducted with students, for example, many students feel that there is a substantial increase in enrollment. One FGD participant from Erbore had the following opinion.

Before SCN-E's project, pastoralists were not attending school seriously. At present, however, many children are going to school. The number of students attending school has increased now. The number of female students has also increased.

Another student who participated in the same FGD as the above student had similar opinion.

In the past, teachers and others had to go house to house to beg parents to send their children to school. Because parents were not willing, teachers used to go to the children's homes and teach them there. Currently, however, parents are willing and we are getting better education. ... Parents are now sending their children, both boys and girls, to school.

The coordinator of SCN-E's project in Hamer woreda had similar opinion but he believed that the number of students attending school could have even been larger. He stated his view regarding the increase in students' enrollment as follows.

In an effort to increase access to education, the project has constructed many schools. In Hamer woreda, there are 38 kebeles. Except in one kebele, there are schools in all other kebeles. Nevertheless, not all school age children got the chance to attend school. There are two main reasons for this. One is the settlement of the community which is much dispersed. The second reason relates to the community's culture and life style. Parents are not willing to send all their children to school.

The above respondents and others have affirmed that the number of students who are going to school have increased significantly particularly when compared with the condition before SCN-E's intervention. However, as will be discussed later, there is a strong belief among respondents that parents are sending one or two of their children to school; they want the other children for other tasks, notably for herding their cattle.

(B) Initiative to Improving Quality of Education

After improving access to education in the woreda through construction of primary schools, ECD and ABE centers in the 2008-2010 project, SCN-E has launched another project (2011-2013) which aims to

contribute to quality of education. The initiative to improve quality of education encompasses several planned activities. These include employing skilled facilitators, providing training so as to improve the teaching competence of facilitators and teachers, upgrading ABE centers, and creating better learning environment in the schools through providing better facilities/furniture and equipment.

In an interview conducted at Dimeka Primary School, the head teacher had the following to say in this connection.

To improve quality, working on teachers is a decisive issue. Those students who came to this school from rural areas did not get good teachers and they do not thus have good background. It is relatively better in our school. So our first task should be building teachers' capacity. There is a need to organize on-the-job training in such areas as teaching methods, classroom management and handling of students, and in English language improvement. It is common to observe problems of quality among teachers who have diploma let alone teachers with certificates.

The head teacher's emphasis on quality of education matches the Ministry of Education's (MOE) concern. After improving access to education significantly throughout the country, MOE has been implementing projects to improve quality of general education. SCN-E's initiative therefore goes hand in hand with MOE's strategy and supports MOE's efforts to improve quality of education in the country. According to the head teacher, building the capacity of teachers through training should be the main focus of SCN-E's initiative.

The head teacher also emphasized the challenges the school community has faced in relation to maintaining quality of education. He said,

... Maintaining quality of education is a challenge if we cannot distribute textbooks to students. In our school, one problem pertains to textbooks. Except in Grade Five where there is a one-to-one student-textbook ratio (for Amharic, Basic Science and Mathematics), in upper grades the problem is serious. For example, there is a serious constraint in Grade Eight, English, Civics, and Social Studies textbooks.

Here also the head teacher raised an important point pertaining to textbook distribution that affects quality of education. The problem of textbooks in Hamer woreda has also been raised by several

students who participated in FGDs. All these ideas point to the need for working on quality of education. SCN-E's initiative (through its project in the third phase, 2011-2013) to work on quality of education is thus relevant and timely.

One can also observe another dimension that clearly shows the relevance of the project. This is the project's effort to promote school health and nutrition. As shown below (see Table 7), primary school children and children in the ECD centers used the de-worming and trachoma treatment which were made available by the project. This has helped a total of 6,223 preschool and school age children (3,680 male and 2,543 female children) to be healthy and to attend school. Besides, the project has provided medical supplies to Hamer WHO and the supplies were used to treat 24,338 persons 60 percent of whom were females.

3.1.3. Efficiency of the 2008-2010 Project

To evaluate efficiency of the project, several questions were raised in relation to the extent to which the project put measures to optimize levels of outputs using the available resources. The project's efficiency was assessed from the standpoint of time and financial efficiency.

(A) The Project's Efficiency in Terms of Time

Although the constructions of several schools and centers were completed on time, several others were delayed. One example is Shanko ECD center. The construction had not been completed and the building was not delivered according to the original schedule. At the time of data collection, however, Shanko ECD center was completed and had actually started accepting and serving young children.

In addition, SCN-E's project coordinator who is working at Hamer WEO told one of the consultants about other delayed constructions as follows.

Two upgraded primary schools (which used to be ABE centers) were not delivered as per the schedule. However, they are completed now and will be functional in Meskerem 2005 E.C. [that is, September 2012]. Similarly, though completed now, the ECD centers in Dambaiti [Turmi Cluster] and Kaissa [Dimeka Cluster] were also among those which were not delivered on time.

Asked about the reasons for the delay in construction and delivery of buildings, the coordinator stated,

It is obvious that during the rainy season, transportation is a challenge. We cannot transport construction materials to Hamer woreda as planned whenever there is heavy rain. That was the main reason.

During the fieldwork, the consultants had the chance to observe several bridges that have not yet been completed which could make transportation difficult. The consultants had also the opportunity to see how the rain made the already existing transportation problem even worse. The reason for the delay in completing constructions on time is therefore understandable; it is beyond the project personnel's control.

Apart from delays in construction, a group interview (held with the WEO head, education quality process owner and SCN-E Hamer project coordinator) affirmed that materials and furniture for schools (such as chairs and tables) were not purchased on time. They stressed that purchases were not often carried out on time. They have admitted, however, that capacity building training particularly for teachers and facilitators and community mobilization workshops were accomplished according to the schedule initially set.

Besides, the 2010 project report confirmed that there were some other reasons which were responsible for the delay of some of the project's activities. According to the report, the financial disbursement procedure employed by the Hamer woreda finance office was a bottleneck that caused postponement of several activities of the project. But it should be noted that the financial administration under the Hamer WFO had positive sides as well.

In an effort to obtain additional data on the financial administration of the project, a team of three officials (WEO head, WEO education quality process owner and SCN-E project Hamer woreda coordinator) were asked to share their opinions in a group interview. In response, the team identified both weaknesses and strengths. In relation to the main strength, the team said,

Whenever SCN-E would not release the project budget in time to accomplish activities according to schedule, the plans would still be implemented using money from other government sources. As soon as the budget is released by SCN-E, the money utilized would be replaced. This is one positive aspect of the financial administration under Hamer WFO.

In a similar manner, the team identified weaknesses and described them as follows.

Purchasing was often not done on time; there were delays. Besides, bids were not handled in an organized manner. Because Hamer is remote, one cannot get a sufficient number of contractors who would participate in the bids. A further weakness is that data pertaining to the financial administration were not well organized. Finally, because it follows government procedures, the financial administration lacks flexibility. For example, if a budget is initially allocated by the project for an activity and if the project personnel feel that task is no longer necessary and want to utilize the money for other purposes, this would not be permitted by the WFO.

The team members were further asked to give their opinions on the possible causes of the weaknesses and alternative approaches that could be used instead. Accordingly, the group thought that while the financial administration is good in some ways, Hamer WFO often took relatively much time to accomplish purchases and bids. Focusing on the causes and suggested solutions, the team added,

Hamer WFO suffers shortage of personnel and the office cannot handle the bids and purchases of Hamer woreda offices as a whole. But SCN-E is in a better position than Hamer WFO in terms of personnel and capacity. Thus, SCN-E should play a role in accomplishing some major tasks such as building construction and handling of bids on behalf of Hamer WFO.

In sum, one can observe that financial administration of the project under Hamer WFO has both pros and cons. In general, the weaknesses seem to outweigh the strengths. The interviewees also indicated shortage of staff at the WFO as the main cause of the problem. To overcome the problem, they suggested that some major activities (e.g., construction and bids) be handled by SCN-E country office on behalf of Hamer WFO.

(B) Financial Efficiency of the 2008-2010 Project

Table 5 shows the proportion of the actual expenditure spent across the main activities of the project. But according to the terminal project performance report (2011), the total project cost was planned to be Birr 10,871,210. However, the actual expenditure was Birr 22,864,555.90. The difference between the planned budget and the budget that was actually utilized is therefore Birr 11,993,345.90. That is, the actual expenditure was slightly more than twice as much as the planned cost. How did this happen? What were the reasons for spending additional budget? Were there additional constructions?

Table 5. Financial Utilization of the Project (2008-2010)

Item	Amount in Birr	Percent
Construction	16,233,598.00	71.01
Purchase of equipment	1,018,576.00	4.45
Capacity building activities	2,394,753.84	10.47
Administrative costs	1,803,980.00	7.89
Purchase of stationery, sports materials, etc.	1,413,666.16	6.18
Total	22,864,554.00	100

(Source: Project Annual Report, 2010)

As shown in the next section (that is, effectiveness of the project), comparison of the constructions (e.g., number of primary schools) planned and actually accomplished indicate a big difference in some cases. For example, although the project planned to construct four lower primary schools, actually nine were constructed. This and other discrepancies between the planned and the accomplished tasks may partly explain why the project's actual expenditure was more than the planned cost. But is this the only explanation we can get? Or is there something else? What were the main features of the project's financial administration? Were there problems?

In an effort to seek answers to the above questions, we reviewed documents and conducted an interview with the project coordinator at Hamer WEO. A review of the 2010 project report indicated some problems that are summarized below.

- The reluctance of the Hamer woreda finance office to run financial matters in the year 2010 was a serious problem that forced many of the tasks to be delayed. Whereas this resulted in postponement of activities, this in turn had some negative financial consequences. With postponement of activities, prices have increased a great deal and that demanded additional budget.
- The rise in the price of construction materials as mentioned above required additional budget beyond the planned one.
- The increase in the price of fuel together with the large area of land in Hamer woreda that was covered by the project further necessitated additional budget.

Apart from the above explanations for the additional budget expenditure, interview with the project coordinator at Hamer WEO indicated that there were problems in financial disbursement at the woreda level. In his own words,

There was a serious problem in financial disbursement at Hamer Woreda Finance Office. The procedure was very bureaucratic and we had to wait for a long time for the purchase of materials. The procedure was that all sector offices had to submit purchase requests and it is after collecting all these demands that the woreda finance office would begin the purchasing process.

In addition to the problem pertaining to financial disbursement, the coordinator confirmed that there were tasks that needed additional budget. According to him,

There was a need to expand and/or extend some of the offices and services. When the number of kindergarten children increased, there was a need to expand KGs. There was also a need to expand the woreda education office. Expansion was necessary and that required additional budget.

Taken together, the need for additional budget may be explained by the additional constructions accomplished, the expansion work done and other problems that resulted from the financial administration procedure of the Hamer woreda finance office which forced the project to postpone tasks.

3.1.4. Effectiveness of the 2008-2010 Project

The overall project objective or goal of the education project was to help children develop to their full potential. The specific objectives of this project were the following.

- To improve the quality of children's learning in schools and ECD centers;
- To implement in an integrated manner Basic Education, Early Childhood Development (ECD) and School Health and Nutrition (SHN);
- To create favourable learning environment for children in general and girls in particular;
- To build the capacity of the local community and government bodies on education.

In order to achieve the above specific objectives, the following major activities categorized under four themes – school construction, capacity building, provisions of facilities and community mobilization – were carried out in the period 2008-2010 in Hamer woreda. The paragraphs that follow present a

thorough examination of the effectiveness of the project in implementing the plans or in achieving the specific objectives listed above.

(A) Constructions of Schools and Centers

The major activities pertaining to construction which were planned and accomplished in the period 2008-2010 were construction of first cycle primary schools, ABE centers, ECD centers, latrine for boys and girls, potable water points and the expansion of WEO.

As shown in Table 6 below, all six activities were carried out fully in the project period. Comparison of the planned and the accomplished activities further indicate that the project has not only achieved its objective fully but has also gone beyond its plans. More specifically, the project has constructed roughly twice as many primary schools, ABE centers and ECD centers as originally planned putting the achievement level at 200 percent or even beyond in the case of constructing first cycle primary schools. But as indicated above, the project had utilized more budget than was originally planned.

Table 6. Constructions Planned and Accomplished by the Project, 2008-2010

No.	Activities	Planned	Accomplished	Achievement Level (in %)
1	First Cycle Primary Schools	4	9	225
2	Latrine for boys and girls	5	5	100
3	ABE Centers	3	6	200
4	ECD Centers	3	6	200
5	Potable water	10	10	100
6	WEO Expansion	1	1	100

(Source: Project Annual Report, 2010)

(B) Capacity Building Activities

As presented in Table 7 below, the capacity building activities were employment of ABE facilitators, providing training to teachers and facilitators, experience sharing visits, and providing training to mothers on food preparation and providing training to kebele level advocacy team on child rights. Table 7 also presents comparison of the capacity building activities which were planned against the actually accomplished activities as well as the level of achievement for each activity.

Table 7: Capacity Building Activities Planned and Accomplished by the Project, 2008-2010

No	Activities	Planned	Accomplished	Achievement Level (in %)
1	Employment of ABE facilitators	32	42	131
2	Training Teachers, WEO staff, and facilitators	87	84	96.6
3	Training on Teaching Methods	29	29	100
4	Training on CRC, HTP and HIV/AIDS	63	74	117
5	Training on Student centered approaches of teaching	108	90	83.3
6	Training on creating linkages between ABE and schools and clubs	18 Formal and 24 ABE	18 Formal and 24 ABE	100
6	Experience sharing abroad	12	12	100
7	In-country experience sharing	16	16	100
8	Train Mothers on food preparation	24	35	146
9	Train Kebele level advocacy team on CR for education and health	350	375	107

(Source: Project Annual Report)

The data in the above table show that the project actually achieved below the target only in two areas: (1) training teachers, WEO staff and facilitators (96.6 percent) and (2) training provided on student centered teaching methods (83.3 percent). In all other areas, the project's level of achievement of its targets was either 100 percent or more.

In addition to the data obtained from documents, an interview conducted with SCN-E's Dimeka Office staff confirmed that the project has provided different trainings for teachers and facilitators. He stated,

The project has provided on-the-job training to teachers in several areas. It has also supported ABE facilitators to get teaching certificate and to secure permanent employment as teachers. This was arranged in collaboration with Arba Minch Teacher Education College. Furthermore, some PTA members have also participated in experience sharing visits. In my opinion, these supports had resulted in relative improvement of the community's participation and student enrollment.

Furthermore, teachers who filled in the questionnaire were asked whether they had any opportunity to participate in at least one training session. Among 38 teachers who responded to this item, 21 (55.3%) of them were positive. A follow up question asked them the areas on which they received training. The most frequent areas of training mentioned were continuous assessment and evaluation, preparation of

lesson plans, preparing teaching materials from locally available materials, hygiene, HTPs and HIV/AIDS.

In addition to the development of manpower capacities for the education sector in Hamer woreda, the project has provided the schools and centers with equipment, furniture, reading materials, computers, printers, copy machine, de-worming and trachoma treatment, and medical supplies to schools, among other things. The main aim of the provisions is to strengthen the capacity of the institutions. Table 8 shows data pertaining to the distribution of the equipment across the schools in the woreda.

One can observe from Table 8 that the project has distributed the equipment to the schools and WEO mostly according to its plans. This was true for furniture and equipment, internet equipment, IED/BCC materials and support to REB, ZED and neighboring woredas. But the project has distributed reading materials, stationery for students and the institutions, computers, printers and copy machines more than its original plan. The project performed slightly below its plans in de-worming and trachoma treatment and in medical supplies and support to Hamer woreda Health Office.

Table 8: Distribution of Furniture, Equipment, and Reading Materials: Plan Vs. Accomplishment (2008-2010)

No	Activities	Planned	Accomplished	Achievement Level (in %)
1	Furniture and equipment	812	821	101
2	Reading materials, stationery to students and to the institutes	1500	1577	105
3	Vehicles	1 car and 5 motorbikes	1 car and 5 motorbikes	100
4	Computers and printers	4	7	175
5	Copy machine	1	2	200
6	Internet equipment	1	1	100
7	IED/BCC materials	5	5	100
8	Support to REB, ZED and neighboring Woredas	5	5	100
9	De-worming and trachoma treatment	6513	3680 male children aged 7-14 and 2543 female children aged 2-5	96
10	Medical supply and support to HWHO	25,000	24338 persons and 60% of them were females	97.4

(Source: Project Annual Report, 2010)

Similar to the data obtained through review of documents, FGD conducted with male students in Erbore Full Primary School confirmed that the SCN-E project has accomplished several activities. One of the FGD participants said,

By constructing buildings for the school, the project has upgraded the lower primary school to full primary school. Besides, it has supported the school by providing materials and furniture like chairs, blackboard and the like. The materials provided to the school are of good quality and were presented on time.

(C) Community Mobilization

Community mobilization and sensitization is crucial in traditional societies and communities where the value of education is not recognized. Cognizant of the benefits of such activities in the provision of basic education efforts, the project has carried out different activities including sensitizing the community in such areas as the value of education, importance of educating girls, harmful traditional practices in the community, HIV and AIDS, etc.

According to SCN-E's Dimeka office staff, the project has carried out several activities in mobilizing the community. He stated,

The project has accomplished several activities in relation to sensitizing community members in an effort to reduce HTPs, child rights violations, and HIV/AIDS. In addition, the project has helped schools to establish Anti-HIV/AIDS club, Child Rights club, etc. It further supported the clubs financially to develop their own plans and to implement them.

Apart from the data obtained through interview, Table 9 presents data obtained from project documents pertaining to the efforts exerted in community mobilization and sensitization so as to achieve objectives of the project. The results indicate that the quarterly review meeting was conducted as planned. Concerning participatory community conversation, the data indicate that the project performed beyond its plans. Although the plan was to involve 3000 community members, the actual number of participants was 4880. The only area in which the project performed slightly below its target relates to the training of kebele level advocacy team on child rights.

Table 9. Community Mobilization and Review Meeting carried out by the Project

No	Activities	Planned	Accomplished	Achievement Level (in %)
1	Participatory community conversation on education, HIV/AIDS, HTP, CRC and girls' education	3000	4880	163
2	Train Kebele level advocacy team on CR for education and health	1140	1125	98.7
3	Quarterly Review Meeting	6	6	100

(Source: Project Annual Report)

Regarding achieving the targets set, the project has performed well. But going one step further, we need to ask as to whether the community mobilization efforts have achieved their objectives (that is, changes in attitudes of the community). In response, it is not difficult to see from the foregoing discussion that there are changes in attitude toward the education of children including girls. Parents are sending their children to school. As a result, the number of children in school has been increasing during the project period (2008 – 2010). This is true not only for primary school students but also for preschool children who are enrolled in the ECD centers.

The change in attitude is not complete, however. This is because parents are sending only some of their children to school. According to parents, they need at least two children – one for herding goats/sheep and another for the cattle – who do not go to school. Thus, on the one hand, there is a change in attitude. Although slow, we must acknowledge the change. But on the other hand, the life style of the pastoralists requires each family to have at least two children who do not go to school to take care of the sheep/goats and the cattle. Even those men, who are considered influential by school teachers and who have supported the schools in persuading community members to send their children to school, do not send at least two of their children to school. The life style of the pastoralists is therefore a hindrance to efforts that aimed to bring about attitude change in the community.

Coming back to the question of whether community mobilization efforts have achieved their objectives, one can say that partly they have but much more effort shall be exerted to make the changes complete. At the same time, given the community's life style, community mobilization efforts need to realize that

complete changes in attitude may take time and that there is a need to be patient and to adjust their efforts accordingly.

In an effort to obtain additional data regarding community mobilization efforts and the reasons why the efforts did not bring about the necessary changes in the community's awareness and attitudes in Hamer woreda, a group interview was held (with the Hamer WEO head, the WEO education quality process owner and SCN-E Hamer woreda coordinator). Asked about whether they believe that community mobilization activities have been carried out as planned, the team stated that "Emphasis is not often placed on community mobilization and participation; efforts are minimal." According to the interviewees, "there were attempts to mobilize the community but effort was not exerted on continuous basis."

The interviewees were also asked to share their opinions on how community mobilization could be accomplished better in the future. In response, the team members took turns and clarified their opinions as follows.

- To organize experience sharing visits to woredas within the South Omo Zone which have good experiences in community mobilization. We can learn a lot from woredas in the zone with good track records in community mobilization.
- This experience visit shall be organized especially for leaders from those kebeles which have faced challenges in community mobilization and participation.
- One can also utilize educated individuals who originally came from Hamer communities and ethnic groups and who are working in the woreda at present. First, though, orientation shall be given to these individuals before sending them to their communities as agents for mobilizing the communities.
- Other agents can also be selected from each kebele. Providing training to influential individuals from each kebele and sending them back to their communities to mobilize the community is another thing that can be done. In fact, follow up and encouraging these people is essential if it is to be fruitful.
- Training can also be organized for youth from Hamer woreda on harmful traditional practices (especially the culture that undermines education of girls) and utilizing the youth as change agents who would create/raise the communities' awareness.

In summary, the interviewees suggested that less emphasis is given to community mobilization as a useful approach to improve community participation. Their suggestions regarding ways of making community mobilization more fruitful include experience sharing visits, training and utilizing the youth, and other influential people from the woreda including those who are educated.

(D) Improved Enrollment and Reduction in Wastage Rate

Another indicator of effectiveness is improvement in enrolment of students in schools as well as reduction in wastage (dropout and repetition) rate due to the project's intervention. In relation to enrollment, students who participated in an FGD conducted in Erbore Full Primary School voiced their appreciation as follows.

The main reason why the number of students in Erbore School has increased is Save the Children. That is, by opening ABE centers around Erbore and by hiring teachers [facilitators], the project has been doing a great work. The project has accomplished different tasks. It has also helped children to continue their schooling here in Erbore when they complete their education up to grade four in their village.

The enrolment data obtained from documents are presented in Table 10 below. The data clearly show that there was no enrolment in ABE centers at all before SCN-E's Pastoralist Basic Education Project. At the end of the first project period (that is, 2005-2007), 758 children were enrolled in ABE centers. This number has more than doubled (1637) at the end of the second project period (2008-2010).

Unlike ABE centers, there were two full primary schools (Grades 1-8) and five lower primary schools (Grades 1-4) in Hamer Woreda before 2005 or prior to SCN-E's intervention. As a result, there were 968 students in 2004. One can observe that a relatively small improvement (from 968 to 1120) was registered in student enrolment during the first project period (that is, at the end of 2007). But a remarkable increase in student enrolment was observed annually in the second project period. At the end of the second project period (that is, at the end of 2010), the increase in enrolment was substantial. In light of the student enrolment figure before the project, the enrolment at the end of 2010 has grown to more than three times. Thus, gross enrolment has increased more than 300 percent from the end of 2004 to the end of 2010.

Table 10. Improved Student Enrolment due to SCN-E's Intervention

Year	ABE	Formal	ECD	Total
2004 (Before SCN's Intervention)	0	968	32	1000
2007	758	1120	32	1878
2008	1130	1890	181	3201
2009	1232	2120	332	3684
2010	1637	2883	498	5018

(Source: Project Annual Report, 2010)

The same holds true for enrolment in ECD centers. There was no growth in enrolment during the first project period (2005-2007). In the second project period (2008-2010), however, there was a remarkable growth in enrolment annually. At the end of 2010, enrolment of preschoolers grew to 498. In view of the 32 children who were in kindergarten before the start of SCN-E's project, the growth of enrolment at the end of 2010 is more than 15 times. This shows how successful the project was in the construction of ECD centers and in attracting preschool children to the centers.

Examination of pass and wastage rates for primary school students and coming up with a fixed figure for Hamer woreda as a whole was not possible because of lack of complete data for students in each school. Despite this problem, attempt was made to make use of the available data and to give some insights in to the pass and wastage rates for some primary school students (Grades 1-4) about whom we got complete data. Detailed statistics on enrolment, dropout, failure or repetition for students in Grades 1-4 are given in a table in the annex (see Annex 9). For the sake of convenience, it would suffice to present here only part of the annexed data. The data are presented in Table 11 below.

The data indicate that wastage and pass rates differ from school to school. In some schools, the wastage rate was as small as one percent (for Shanko and Kara Lebuk Primary Schools in 2002 E.C.). In other schools (Boriya Primary School), the wastage rate in 2001 (E.C.) was as high as 54.9 percent. Despite high wastage rates in some schools, one can observe that the wastage rate in the first cycle of Primary School (grades 1-4) is generally not high. Alternatively, this means that in the first cycle (grades 1-4), the promotion rate is relatively good, reaching as high as 99 percent. This, in turn, means that in the first cycle, the retention rate is very high particularly in some schools.

Table 11. Pass and Wastage Rates for Students in Grades 1-4 by School and Sex (2001– 2002 E.C.)

School	Status	2001 E.C.			2002 E.C.		
		M	F	T	M	F	T
Boriya	Registered	48	23	71	36	15	51
	Sat for Exam	26	6	32	36	13	49
	Promoted (%)	26 (54.2%)	6 (26.1%)	32 (45.1%)	36 (100%)	13 (86.7%)	49 (96.1%)
	Failed	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Dropped Out	22	17	39	0	2	2
	Wastage (%)	22 (45.8%)	17 (73.9%)	39 (54.9%)	0 (0%)	2 (13.3%)	2 (3.9 %)
Dimeka	Registered	182	136	318	167	152	319
	Sat for Exam	150	132	282	138	114	252
	Promoted (%)	150 (82.4%)	132 (97.1%)	282 (88.7%)	127 (76%)	100 (65.8%)	227 (71.2%)
	Failed	0	0	0	11	14	25
	Dropped Out	32	4	36	29	38	67
	Wastage (%)	32 (17.6%)	4 (2.9%)	36 (11.3%)	40 (24%)	52 (34.2%)	92 (28.8 %)
Shanko	Registered	84	22	106	81	20	101
	Sat for Exam	78	20	98	80	20	100
	Promoted (%)	78 (92.9%)	20 (90.9%)	98 (92.5%)	80 (98.8%)	20 (100%)	100 (99%)
	Failed	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Dropped Out	6	2	8	1	0	1
	Wastage (%)	6 (7.1%)	2 (9.1%)	8 (7.5%)	1 (1.2%)	0 (0%)	1 (1%)
Kara Lebuk	Registered	47	26	73	52	44	96
	Sat for Exam	44	15	59	51	44	95
	Promoted (%)	44 (93.6%)	15 (57.7%)	59 (80.8%)	51 (98.1%)	44 (100%)	95 (99%)
	Failed	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Dropped Out	3	11	14	1	0	1
	Wastage (%)	3 (6.4%)	11 (42.3%)	14 (19.2%)	1 (1.9%)	0 (0%)	1 (1.0%)
TOTAL	Registered	361	207	568	336	231	567
	Sat for Exam	298	173	471	305	191	496
	Promoted (%)	298 (82.5%)	173 (83.6%)	471 (82.9%)	294 (87.5%)	177 (76.6%)	471 (83.1%)
	Failed	0	0	0	11	14	25
	Dropped Out	63	34	97	31	40	71
	Wastage (%)	63 (17.5%)	34 (16.4%)	97 (17.1%)	44 (13.1%)	54 (23.4%)	96 (16.9%)

Source. Hamer Woreda Education Office

According to the SCN-E staff based in Dimeka, the difference in retention of students across schools is explained in part by the commitment of teachers. He stated,

Given the similarity in culture and geographical location and settlement of the communities in Hamer woreda, the difference in students' results, participation and drop out was surprising. What we learned from this difference was that some committed teachers can have considerable contribution. Dropout and repetition rates were very small in schools where there are courageous and committed teachers and head teachers compared to schools where there are no such teachers.

The promotion rate for students in the first cycle (Grades 1-4) was 82.9 percent in 2001 E.C. and 83.1 percent in 2002 E.C. Assuming that the data we obtained from the four primary schools represents the woreda, we can compare the promotion rate with that of the average for primary schools (Grades 1-4) in South Omo Zone and SNNPR at large. The corresponding average promotion rates for South Omo Zone and SNNPR were 81.9 percent and 75.4 percent respectively for 2001 E.C. (SNNPR Education Bureau, 2011). The promotion rate for Hamer woreda primary schools (grades 1-4) was therefore better than the average promotion rate for South Omo Zone and SNNPR. This in essence means wastage rate in Hamer woreda is also smaller than the average wastage rate of both South Omo Zone and SNNPR.

In examining pass and wastage (dropout and repetition) rates for students in the second cycle (Grades 5-8), focus was made on grade eight students. This was so because the data for students in grade eight were better and more complete than the data for students in grades 5-7. The data are presented in Table 12 below for two full primary schools (grades 1-8), the only full primary schools in Hamer woreda until the end of 2002 E.C.

The data in Table 12 show that the average promotion rates for grade eight students (2000-2002 E.C.) in Dimeka Primary School and Turmi Primary School were 66.1 percent and 76.6 percent, respectively. Since there were only two full primary schools during these three years, the average promotion rate for grade eight students in Hamer Woreda was 69.7 percent. Similarly, the wastage rate for grade eight students in Hamer woreda was 30.3 percent. The promotion rates for students who took grade eight regional examination in South Omo Zone and SNNPR schools in 2002 E.C. were respectively 46.6 percent and 54.4 percent respectively (SNNPR Education Bureau, 2011). Thus, the promotion rate for Hamer woreda was far better. That is, in 2002 E.C., the promotion rate for Hamer woreda was 67.6 percent and this is better than both the zonal average (46.6 percent) and the regional average (54.4 percent).

Table 12. Pass and Wastage Rates on Grade Eight Regional Examination by School and Sex (2000 – 2002 E.C.)

Year (E.C.)	Status	Dimeka Primary School			Turmi Primary School		
		M	F	T	M	F	T
2000	Registered	20	14	34	20	2	22
	Sat for Exam	19	13	32	20	2	22
	Promoted (%)	19 (95%)	13 (93%)	32 (94%)	15 (75%)	1 (50%)	16 (73%)
	Failed	0	0	0	5	1	6
	Dropped Out	1	1	2	0	0	0
	Wastage (%)	1 (5%)	1 (7%)	2 (6%)	5 (25%)	1 (50%)	6 (27%)
2001	Registered	24	10	34	15	6	21
	Sat for Exam	22	10	32	14	6	20
	Promoted (%)	11 (46%)	2 (20%)	13 (38%)	13 (87%)	5 (83%)	18 (86%)
	Failed	11	8	19	1	1	2
	Dropped Out	2	0	2	1	0	1
	Wastage (%)	13 (54%)	8 (80%)	21 (62%)	2 (13%)	1 (17%)	3 (14%)
2002	Registered	35	18	53	17	4	21
	Sat for Exam	33	17	50	17	4	21
	Promoted (%)	23 (66%)	12 (67%)	35 (66%)	12 (71%)	3 (75%)	15 (71%)
	Failed	10	5	15	5	1	6
	Dropped Out	2	1	3	0	0	0
	Wastage (%)	12 (34%)	6 (33%)	18 (34%)	5 (29%)	1 (25%)	6 (29%)
TOTAL (2000 – 2002)	Registered	79	42	121	52	12	64
	Sat for Exam	76	40	116	51	12	63
	Promoted (%)	53 (67.1%)	27 (64.3%)	80 (66.1%)	40 (76.9%)	9 (75%)	49 (76.6%)
	Failed	21	13	34	11	3	14
	Dropped Out	5	2	7	1	0	1
	Wastage (%)	26 (32.9%)	15 (35.7%)	41 (33.9%)	12 (23.1%)	3 (25%)	15 (23.4%)

Source. Hamer Woreda Education Office

One can observe from the foregoing discussion that Hamer WEO has performed better in terms of promotion rate (or alternatively wastage rate) than both South Omo Zone and SNNPR. Besides, this better performance was observed both in the first cycle (Grades 1-4) and at the end of the second cycle (Grade 8 regional examination).

Examining the pass rate and wastage rate for male and female students, one can also see that except for the year 2002 E.C., the pass rate for female students was slightly lower than that for male students. Alternatively, except for the year 2002 E.C., the wastage rate for girls was slightly higher than the rate for boys. In both cases, girls were disadvantaged. Why? What explanations can we find for these gender differences favoring male children?

Interviews with stakeholders clearly indicated that community members are not comfortable when sending girls to school. Many do not send their daughters at all for many reasons. In an interview, a teacher in Boriya Primary School confirmed that there are problems in the community. He said,

Because female children are sources of wealth for their parents, parents do not send their daughters to school. They don't send their first born sons either. If they send a first born son to school and if he chooses to abandon the culture, he may decide not to marry. As a result, the family would not accept him as a member at home and he would be cursed. This may also create problems for his younger siblings because they cannot marry before he does. Even if they want, it takes a long process making the matter very difficult.

The SCN-E's Dimeka office staff, on his part confirmed that there are improvements nowadays but there are problems as well. According to him,

Children's participation has been increasing from time to time. During the 2000-2002 (E.C.) period, enrollment has increased by 38 percent. Although the difference between female and male children is still large, the gap has relatively narrowed when compared with earlier years. Dropout rate in Hamer woreda has also shown a significant reduction.

In 2003 E.C., the number of schools with full primary grades (that is, grades 1-8) increased to four. Table 13 shows pass rate and wastage rate for the four primary schools. In this case, the data indicate disappointing results for all schools. The wastage rate for each school was greater than 60 percent. Considering the students in Hamer woreda as a whole (that is, students in all four schools together), we can see from the table that among the students who took grade eight regional examination in 2003 E.C.,

65.9 percent have failed. What is more, in one of the schools (Shanko), no one of the students passed the exam yielding a wastage rate of 100 percent. Analysis of gender differences also shows that female students are at a disadvantage in two (Dimeka and Erbore) of the three schools.

Table 13. Pass and Wastage Rates on Grade Eight Regional Examination by School and Sex (2003 E.C.)

School	Took Exam (N)			Promoted (N)			Failed (N)			Wastage (%)		
	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
Dimeka	45	34	79	23	8	31	22	26	48	49	76	60.8
Erbore	12	7	19	6	0	6	6	7	13	50	100	68.4
Shanko	7	0	7	0	0	0	7	0	7	100	0	100
Turmi	15	12	27	6	2	8	9	10	19	60	17	70.4
Total	79	53	132	35	10	45	44	43	87	56	81	65.9

Source. Hamer Woreda Education Office

One can generally observe that the project has definitely increased the number of students enrolled in schools. But it was not as successful in improving dropout and repetition rates. In other words, the project was not equally effective in improving retention of children in schools. What are the reasons? This question was presented to participants of a group interview (comprising the Hamer WEO head, the education quality process owner and SCN-E Hamer coordinator). Their response was as follows.

In 2003 and 2004, student dropout and repetition rates have shown reduction. For example, in 2003 dropout rate was 4.1% whereas it was 7.6% in 2004. In general, these are not large figures. In fact, before 2003, the dropout rate was large. But there was a reason for that. In September, student registration is done with pressure from administration officials including the leadership who would visit each kebele to urge community members to send their children to school. In some kebeles, the officials sometimes register more children than the actual number of children in the kebele. In some other kebeles, they register children who are not old enough to go to school. But this exercise has inflated the dropout rate because these children do not come to school in the first place even though the administration officials have already registered them as beginners. Because these kinds of problems are significantly reduced since 2003, the dropout rate is relatively small now.

Besides, they were asked about the possible reasons for students' repetition. In response, they identified the language of instruction as a possible cause for student repletion.

The students learn in Amharic and English. These are their second and third languages. They are not learning in their mother tongue. For this reason, they cannot easily understand the lessons their teachers deliver and thus many may face class repetition. Another reason for student repetition is that students at the ABE centers were not taught by qualified teachers. Many of the facilitators who deliver lessons at the ABE centers had not received any kind of training that would make them good teachers. As a result, students might not have been taught in proper ways and that may create understanding problems on the part of students.

In addition to medium of instruction, the interviewees identified teachers' qualification as a main issue that can affect student understanding, performance and class repetition. They were further asked to suggest possible ways which may help to alleviate the problem and they came up with the following suggestions.

1. To build the capacity of teachers through training. In collaboration with the regional bureau and the zone department, Hamer WEO needs to organize on-the-job (or refresher) training for those who have teaching qualification for the level. This would help teachers to update themselves with new developments in teacher education notably teaching methods. Particularly for the facilitators, Hamer WEO needs to arrange ways whereby they can pursue their education in the summer until they become qualified teachers.
2. To educate the community to send their children to school on regular basis.
3. To develop a culture of recording data accurately especially in September.

In short, to alleviate the problem of student dropout and repetition, there is a need to work on community mobilization and participation, to consider changing the medium of instruction, and to provide training to teachers in an effort to improve their teaching competence. By so doing, Hamer WEO can make the education more relevant and appealing to children which may in turn alleviate the problem of student dropout and repetition.

(E) Students' Academic Performance

To examine students' academic performance, the consultants developed and used three tests (mathematics test for grade four and mathematics and Basic Integrated Science tests for grade five). The students' test scores are given in Table 14 below. The data indicate that the mean score for grade four mathematics test is close to one-half of the maximum possible score (that is, 25 out of 50).

However, the mean scores for grade five mathematics test and Basic Integrated Science test are lower than one-half of the maximum possible score.

A closer analysis of the students' scores indicates that a larger proportion of the students performed below average. That is, on each test, more than one-half of the students were unable to correctly answer at least one-half of the test items. More specifically,

- Among grade four students, 51.4% performed below average (that is, below 50% correct) on the mathematics test.
- At the fifth grade level, the proportion of students who scored below average on the mathematics test or who were unable to answer at least one-half of the items is 55.7%.
- Again at the fifth grade level, the proportion of students who scored below average on the Basic Integrated Science test is 63.3%.

Table 14. Performance Scores: Means and Standard Deviations by Grade Level and Subject

Grade	Subject	N	Mean	SD
Four	Mathematics	74	24.92	8.96
Five	Mathematics	79	22.68	7.90
	Basic Integrated Science	79	21.61	5.72

Note. The maximum possible score for each subject is 50.

Taken together, the majority of students have not performed well on all three subjects both in grade 4 and grade 5. In other words, the students' performance was not generally satisfactory. One can see, however, that students' mathematics performance appeared to be better at grade four level than it is at grade five level. There was a need to closely examine whether there was a difference in mathematics performance due to grade.

The examination of differences in mathematics performance between grade 4 and grade 5 students is necessary because the test items were exactly the same except that the test items for grade 4 were written in Amharic whereas those for grade 5 were written in English. The use of Amharic and English languages in writing the tests is consistent with the medium of instruction for first cycle primary grades (Grades 1-4) and second cycle primary grades (Grades 5-8) in Hamer woreda. During administering the tests, the consultants observed that the students had problems in understanding items written in English more so than understanding items written in Amharic. However, the difference between the two mean

scores is not statistically significant ($t = 1.64$, $p > .05$). One can therefore say that despite a small difference in favor of grade 4 students which is statistically not significant, the two groups are not substantially different.

The consultants' initial expectation was that grade five students would score better than grade four students. The main reason for this expectation was the fact that the test items were the same for both grades. Basically the test items were developed from grade four textbook although grade five textbook has also touched upon at least some of the contents from which the items were developed. This means that the main difference between the two mathematics tests was the languages used to write the items (or medium of instruction).

Given all the similarities, grade five students should have performed significantly better than grade four students had it not been for the language problem (issue) that makes the two test items different in the first place. This argument is reasonable when viewed in light of the one year advantage grade five students have over grade four students. But unlike what is expected, grade four students performed better although the difference was not statistically significant.

Based on the assumption and the result obtained, one may conclude that despite no statistically significant difference between the mean scores, grade four students have scored better probably because the items were presented in Amharic.

Differences in Test Performance due to Gender, Location and Origin

The data pertaining to differences in academic performance due to gender, origin and location are shown in Table 15 below. Examining gender differences first, one can see that at the fourth grade level, the gender difference was statistically significant and in favor of boys. That is, boys performed significantly better than girls on the mathematics test. At the fifth grade level, however, though the trend in mathematics scores was similar and in favor of boys, the difference was not statistically significant. The same was true for the Basic Integrated Science test in grade five. One can therefore say that clear and significant difference between boys and girls appeared in grade four but not in grade five.

Table 15. Means and Standard Deviations of Test Scores by Grade, Gender, Location and Origin

Subject (Grade)	Variable		N	Mean	SD	t
Mathematics (Grade 4)	Gender ^a	Female	25	21.04	9.31	-3.60*
		Male	33	29.09	7.72	
	Location	Dimeka	51	26.51	8.16	2.34*
		Erbore	23	21.39	9.83	
Mathematics (Grade 5)	Gender	Female	28	21.07	6.85	-1.35
		Male	51	23.57	8.35	
	Location	Dimeka	50	25.20	6.69	4.07*
		Erbore	29	18.34	8.04	
	Student Origin	ABE	18	21.78	8.89	-0.55
		Regular	61	22.95	7.64	
Basic Integrated Science (Grade 5)	Gender	Female	28	21.61	5.19	-0.01
		Male	51	21.62	6.04	
	Location	Dimeka	50	21.90	6.22	0.58
		Erbore	29	21.12	4.80	
	Student Origin	ABE	18	22.22	6.80	0.51
		Regular	61	21.43	5.41	

* p < .05

^a16 students in grade four failed to specify their sex.

What about differences due to location of the school? To examine this issue, one school from the woreda town (that is, Dimeka) was compared with another school from a relatively more remote area (that is, Erbore). The results showed that students from Dimeka Primary School performed significantly better on the mathematics test than students from Erbore Primary School. This was true for both grade four and grade five mathematics tests. There was no significant difference on the Basic Integrated Science test due to location. That is, students from both schools performed more or less comparably on the Basic Integrated Science test.

One plausible explanation for the significant difference favoring students from Dimeka Primary School could be that Dimeka is the woreda town and relatively more urbanized than Erbore. Because it is a woreda town, communities residing in the town and its vicinity perhaps better understand the value of

education and support the education of their children, more so than the communities in and around Erbore. Another explanation may be related to the presence of better and more experienced teachers in the woreda town. After serving in remote schools for some years, teachers often ask transfer to a better school in a better place like Dimeka.

The third issue examined was student origin. After completing their Level III studies successfully, ABE students are permitted to pursue their studies as a grade five student in a regular school. As a result, one can get two groups of students in such a class. One group consists of former ABE students who are now pursuing their studies in grade five (ABE Origin) and a second group that comprises students who pursued their studies as a regular student since the beginning (Regular Origin).

The two groups of students were compared to see if they perform on the tests equally well. The results indicated statistically significant difference between the two groups of students neither on the mathematics test nor on the Basic Integrated Science test.

In the absence of a large number of students with ABE origin in the two target schools, the consultants were forced to administer the tests to only 18 grade five students with ABE origin from the two schools, the only available on the test date. Given this problem, we may accept the above result as tentative. However, because we do not know whether the 18 students can represent all students with ABE origin fairly well, we cannot generalize the results to the two populations of students. But if the 18 students are representative of all grade five students with ABE origin, then it means that students with ABE origin perform academically as well as those with regular origin, suggesting that the ABE program is as effective as the regular program.

3.1.5. Impact of the Project (2008 – 2010)

In examining the impact of the project, attention was focused on changes brought about as a result of the project on preschool children, school age children, teachers and facilitators, as well as other key stakeholders of the project. Each of these is presented below.

Impact of the Project on Preschool Children

In many of the primary schools visited for the purpose of collecting data for this evaluation, the consultants have observed ECD centers attached to the primary schools. In each ECD center, the

consultants have also met many preschool children either in class or outside the classroom playing outdoor games. The project provides biscuits and tea to the children and that makes the center appealing to the children. Apart from learning about alphabets, numbers and other pertinent topics appropriate for the level, the children play together using the apparatus for outdoor games made available by the project. According to Hamer WEO representative, the project has contributed a lot to improve education in the woreda. He further stated,

The contribution of SCN-E is very visible in the woreda. Anybody will tell you about Save the Children Norway. One kind of contribution comes from the ECD centers. The centers feed the children and that helped the children from young age to remain in school.

A similar opinion was voiced by a facilitator who works in Erbore ECD center. She stated that the children who had been in ECD centers are more likely to stay in school. She said,

I have been here for three years. The children who started in the ECD center are some of them in grade one and some others in grade two now. The ECD center helps children to stay in the school in the future. Sometimes, parents of the children visit us and ask us about their children.

In general, the ECD center has helped children to develop interest in education. It also helped the children to stay in school. This change can easily be observed when one examines the difference between children who stayed in ECD centers and children who did not. The former are more likely to remain in school. The presence of different outdoor games as well as the biscuits and tea appeared to attract more young children to the ECD centers.

Impact of the Project on School Age Children

Children who participated in the FGDs were asked several questions to examine the changes in their knowledge, attitudes and behavior as a result of the project's intervention. The questions pertain to HIV and AIDS, environmental challenges, child rights, and traditional harmful practices in Hamer woreda. Accordingly the following responses were documented.

In response to the questions posed, the children gave answers that were correct. For example, students who participated in FGD conducted with male children in Dimeka Primary School took turns in

describing HIV, in identifying the means of transmission and in describing the protective measures as follows.

HIV is a virus that weakens our immunity and that exposes us to other diseases. The means of transmission include unsafe sexual intercourse, contact with infected blood, and from mother to child during pregnancy. HIV can be protected through the use of condom, abstinence from sex, to have only one partner, and to avoid sharing objects like needles, razor blades and the like.

Students, males and females alike, who participated in FGDs gave correct answers to the questions we posed about HIV/AIDS. But the children have shown improved knowledge on other topics as well. These included listing the environmental challenges that their surrounding faces (e.g., continuous drought, soil erosion), child rights (e.g., meaning of child rights, the right to education, the right to play). Female students from Dimeka Primary School who participated in FGD were asked to list HTPs that are commonly observed and are causes for concern in Hamer woreda. The participants helped each other and stated, “The commonly observed HTPs in Hamer woreda are female genital mutilation or cutting, early marriage, abandoning one’s child, abortion, and beating girls.”

On their part, male students listed almost the same HTPs as the female students. Responses to other questions pertaining to attitudes toward education, attitudes toward girls’ education, and the benefits of sending girls to school indicated that the students have more or less positive attitudes toward girls and girls’ education.

In addition to the formal school program, the project helped the schools to form different clubs that take care of extra-curricular activities. The most common clubs included Health and HIV and AIDS Club, Natural Science Club, Women and Child Rights Club, Home Economics Club, Sports Club, Music and Drama Club, and Anti-Harmful Traditional Practices Club. Apart from performing different activities in a group setting, children would develop through the different programs of the clubs communication skills, knowledge, and positive attitudes toward fellow children, boys and girls.

Other impacts or changes observed among students have been raised by interviewees. The SNC-E’s project coordinator who works in Hamer WEO described the changes observed among students as follows.

There are observable changes in children though the changes are slow. Nowadays, when young girls are married to older men, siblings have started to say no. In the past, girls used to obey their parents. Because there is a deep-rooted belief that curse brings danger to children, children do not want to be cursed by their parents. This belief is affecting the change to be slow.

Raising a specific example, the coordinator further said,

There is an increase in the number of school going boys and girls. As an example, the number of students in Shanko was only below 50 three years ago. Now it is 156.

Impact of the Project on teachers and facilitators

One of the project's impacts on teachers and facilitators was realized through the capacity building training sessions organized by the project. Among the 38 teachers and facilitators who provided data for this evaluation, 21 of them have received some training whereas 17 respondents did not receive any training. According to the former teachers and facilitators, the areas covered through the training sessions organized by the project include, among others, ECD training for 10 days, continuous assessment and evaluation, preparing teaching materials from locally available resources, hygiene, HTPs, HIV and AIDS, educational supervision and lesson plan preparation.

According to the Hamer WEO representative who gave interview for this evaluation, the project has some impact on teachers and facilitators. Substantiating his position, he stated,

Facilitators have been upgraded to certified teachers and some have already begun pursuing their diploma education. Others have received on-the-job training on continuous assessment and teaching methods among other things.

Particularly for ECD facilitators who did not have any kind of training or experience in teaching, the project organized a 10-day training session that helped the facilitators to handle the children in a better way. According to a facilitator from Erbore ECD center, for example, the training has some positive impact on teaching skills. In her own words,

The training helped me to improve my teaching skills. I am now more confident in my teaching than before the training. I also feel that the training has improved my employability as a facilitator in ECD centers.

Impact of the Project on the Community

One of the impacts of the project on the community is that it has improved the community's participation. The consultants have witnessed such participation in two schools. Local communities in the project sites have contributed their part in keeping the schools clean and in fencing the schools. The consultants have observed parents in some of the schools visited cleaning compounds of the schools as well as taking care of plants in the schools' compounds. The contributions of the local communities are usually in terms of their labor and bringing locally available materials for the schools' fences.

The SCN-E staff at Dimeka office raised some changes observed in the community's participation in different angles of the woreda. He stated,

The community has begun participating in matters concerning education. We can see examples from some schools. In Baniya, Shanko cluster and in Galognagacha, Erbore cluster, students have built their own schools. Besides, the community has hired cooks who prepare food for students. The school feeding program has been supported by the World Food Program. In some schools, community members have hired guards for the schools, paying salaries through monthly contributions.

In addition to participation, there are also changes that one can observe in the community. In connection to this, a representative of Hamer WEO told us his opinion as follows.

I came here in 1994 E.C. I first worked in Erbore. No family would send a girl to school by then. Now it is almost okay for families to send their daughters to school.

The WEO representative went on saying,

The main problem is that the community does not give value to education. The members don't have the awareness that education would help their children. Although slow, there is change, however. One evidence for this change is the increase in the number of girls who are attending school.

Looking impact of the project on the community from a different angle, the representative concluded as follows.

The community's awareness has improved and the condition is better now than before. Traditional practices pertaining to marriage and its processes (e.g., whipping and bull jumping) have been reduced.

The above discussion shows that the project has several impacts on different groups of stakeholders including children, teachers and facilitators and the community at large. Supporting the impacts discussed above, information obtained recently indicate that one can easily observe that the impacts are multidimensional. The Hamer WEO head and the WEO education quality process owner affirmed that

Before SCN-E's intervention, student enrolment in Hamer woreda was only 7%. At present, the gross enrolment ratio has reached 32%. Concerning school construction, among the 20 available schools in Hamer woreda, more than one-half of them were constructed by SCN-E.

As the above excerpt clearly shows, it is obvious that one of the project's visible impacts is the increased number of schools and students enrolled in them. But the participants were asked to think beyond numbers of schools and students and to focus on other, higher level indicators such as the community's awareness.

In response, the Hamer WEO head, the Hamer WEO process owner and the SCN-E Hamer project coordinator took turns in describing what they believed were impacts on the community's awareness. According to them, the following comprised higher level impacts in relation to the community's awareness and its improved participation.

- In the past, community members used to believe that if they send their children to school, they will be spoiled and will not come back to their family. This belief has been changed now. Though not all, many community members in Hamer woreda are sending their children to school.
- Even though limited in number, parents often come to school to see their children learning. They observe when their children write, read the alphabets and do arithmetic operations. They usually become happy and encouraged to continue sending their children to school.
- In some kebeles of Hamer woreda, for example, communities in places like Galonacha, Firgid, and Kena, have built temporary shelter in which students began to learn. They did this on their own initiatives. These changes definitely indicate that the community's awareness is changing in desirable ways.
- At the beginning, facilitators were hired without the necessary training for the position. They were not thus employed as regular teachers. Now, however, their status is changing. They are becoming qualified teachers after receiving training in Teacher Education Colleges. Besides, with the change in

their status from facilitator to teacher, they are entitled to an increased salary scale. As a result, they are stable and are doing their job with satisfaction. This was made possible through chances they got to pursue their education further in colleges in their summer vacation.

In summary, the information obtained from different sources support the belief that the project had multifaceted impacts. While the impacts on the learning environment (more schools and classrooms constructed to serve more students) are visible, higher level changes and impacts that we could not observe directly have also been reported by the participants. These include desirable changes in the community's awareness particularly in relation to children's education. One can definitely say that the project had impacted positively how a portion of the community thinks about education of children. But if we ask how large is that portion of the community that has positive views about the education of children, then the answer may not be satisfactory, indicating the need for further sensitization/education programs directed toward improving the community's awareness. We can therefore observe that the project has positive impacts on members of the community in Hamer woreda but there is a need to scale up efforts to influence and change more community members.

3.1.6. Sustainability

In relation to institutional sustainability, one can observe that all schools and ABE and ECD centers are already functioning under the Hamer WEO. The schools are functioning under the government system and like it does for other government schools, Ministry of Education provides budget to the school in the form of school grant.

Opinions pertaining to sustainability of the project were sought in the interviews conducted with the staff of SCN-E's Dimeka office. He gave his view as follows.

One can say that the project is going smoothly as planned initially. In the design phase of the project, there was agreement that the schools and teachers would be transferred to the government system after a short period of support. With the present condition, if the project phases out, education in the woreda will be affected negatively. Even though the project works in collaboration with the government, the work on education requires broad financial and material support. Under the present condition, the project should not phase out.

At the same time the SCN-E staff seems to be unhappy that the community is not utilizing the opportunities. He said,

Guessing that the project will phase out one day in the future, community members are not fully utilizing the opportunities created by the project. Because most of the supports are provided by the project, the community members exhibit tendencies of dependence on the project. They often say ‘the project will do this or that for us.’

More or less similar belief regarding sustainability of the project was expressed in an interview conducted with the Hamer WEO representative. He said,

In my opinion, it is only SCN-E that works on education in Hamer. If we ask pastoralists about SCN-E, they will tell you clearly about its contributions. If SCN-E stops the project here, I know everything in education would come to an end. ... It is generally difficult to think about sustainability and SCN-E’s leaving from here. But there are some works being done in terms of sensitizing the public and to avoid the dependency syndrome.

The capacity building (that is, training and experience sharing visits) package has helped to change the way children and community members think about education and other related issues such as HTPs and the education of girls. This will obviously help to sustain the changes at least in the short term. At this point, it seems appropriate to present what a parent in Enbule Primary School told the consultants during the fieldwork.

The parent stated that student enrolment is far better now than before. He said that parents have participated and contributed their part when the school was constructed, the main contributions being their labor and locally available materials for constructing the school buildings such as stone and wood. The old man further told the consultants that he was one of the beneficiaries of the experience sharing visits. He said,

The project selected me and sent me to Borena for experience sharing visit. I learned from my visit that unless one attends school, he will remain a servant all his life. The Borenas are our enemies but they are educated. It is well known that if our enemies are educated, they can easily attack and govern us. So as soon as I returned from my visit, I slaughtered an ox and organized an occasion for the community around Enbule. On the occasion, I urged them to send their children to school. Immediately, the community sent 25 children to school. That was how it all started.

The above excerpt clearly shows how the visit of one old man changed the whole community and that is a good example of the multiplier effect of the capacity building package. Whereas this is a good example for changing perceptions of the community, it also shows ownership of the project ideals by the local community. Apart from sending their children to school, community members participate in keeping the schools clean and fenced. All these contribute positively to sustainability of the project's values and impacts at least in the short term.

Clearly, the above paragraphs convey mixed (negative and positive) messages regarding sustainability. But additional information secured recently through a group interview (with Hamer WEO head, Hamer WEO education quality process owner and the Hamer woreda SCN-E coordinator) showed that Hamer WEO and South Omo ZED have plans that will help to sustain the project's ideals and impacts.

According to the interviewees, the educational plans of the Hamer WEO, which is endorsed by the South Omo ZED, include the following.

- To increase student enrolment from 32% to 70%.
- To organize cluster schools so that they can function better.
- To build the capacity of teachers in an effort to improve their teaching competence.
- To build additional schools in an effort to increase student enrolment.
- To improve the quality of education.
- To mobilize the community so as to increase community participation.

Asked about what they are doing at present to ensure sustainability, the participants indicated that

Hamer WEO is working to make the project's outputs sustainable by trying to get children in school and it has plans to implement this. All educational materials bought through the project are being utilized by students. Besides, Hamer WEO alone and in partnership with SCN-E is offering short trainings to teachers in an effort to build their capacity.

These efforts will definitely help to sustain some of the changes already obtained due to SCN-E's intervention. For example, even if the turnover of teachers is a challenge and those teachers who had received some form of training are leaving Hamer woreda, providing training to other teachers periodically would help overcome the challenge at least in part. The participants agreed that both Hamer WEO and South Omo ZED have the same plan and further indicated that

Hamer WEO is working hard to increase student enrolment through planned activities in cooperation with supervisors and head teachers. Hamer WEO is also working hard to see all facilitators get additional college education in the summer that would help them upgrade their status to become qualified teachers.

Asked about what shall be done next to implement the above plans and to further ensure sustainability of the project's impacts and ideals, the participants suggested the following.

Hamer WEO needs to focus on the following tasks: (1) Working hard to raise the community's awareness until it accepts ownership of the project's ideals (e.g., education of children), (2) to transfer the project's plans and outputs step by step to the government's (WEO's) plans and ownership, and (3) to improve the community's participation and contribution through community mobilization. Some community members have already good participation records (e.g., labor contribution in fencing schools; contribution in kind such as giving sheep, goats, and cows to the school) and Hamer WEO needs to work on this in an organized manner to increase the contributions.

In sum, even if some participants doubt sustainability of the project's ideals if SCN-E leaves or the project phases out, Hamer WEO and the South Omo ZED have plans not only to sustain the results that have been registered already but to achieve even more results. In fact, most of the participants agreed that the most important task that would help to strengthen the education system in general and to ensure sustainability of the project's outcomes in particular is to mobilize the communities in Hamer woreda in an effort to increase their participation.

3.1.7. Status of the 2011–2013 Project

After the successful completion of its plans and objectives during the second phase (2008-2010), the project has formulated another third phase for (August 01, 2011 – July 30, 2013) under project title “Education quality improvement in Hamer woreda of the South Omo Zone of SNNPR” with the overall goal of helping children develop their full potential. It is nearly a year since the inception of the third phase. The following section discusses the status of this project as reported during the third quarter. The specific objectives of the project are

- To improve the quality of children's learning in schools and ECD centers
- To implement in an integrated manner Basic education, Early Childhood Development (ECD) and School Health and Nutrition (SHN),
- To create favorable learning environment for children in general and girls in particular

- To build the capacity of the local community and government bodies on education

(A) Construction of Schools

The activities presented in the following table were planned to be carried out during the first year of the project. The data in Table 16 show that all the four types of construction have been accomplished during the first year of the project period (2011-2013) as planned. As a result, the level of achievement of targets is 100 percent. More specifically, the construction of one primary school, upgrading two ABE centers, upgrading two ECD centers and constructing one hostel at Shanko were completed as planned.

Table 16. Construction of schools planned and accomplished in 2011

No	Activities	Plan	Accomplished	Achievement Level (in %)
1	Construct and handover full cycle primary school	1	1	100
2	Upgrade and handover ABE centers	2	2	100
3	Construct and handover standard ECD centers	2	2	100
4	Constructing students hostel/dinning and bed service room	1	1	100

(Source: Project Annual Report, 2011)

(B) Capacity Building

Table 17 below shows planned and accomplished activities in the area of capacity building. It also includes the level of achievement for each item. The project conducted experience sharing visits for directors, ABE facilitators, cluster school supervisors, WEO staff and students, and village level community mobilization activities to enhance children's participation in education.

The experience sharing visit was planned to involve 267 directors, ABE facilitators, supervisors, WEO staff and students. This was actually carried out as planned involving 267 persons. Thus, the achievement level for this item is 100 percent. However, this was not the case for the second item. The level of achievement was 85.1 percent.

Table 17. Capacity building activities of the project in 2011

No	Activities	Planned	Accomplished	Achievement (in %)
1	Conduct experience sharing for directors, ABE facilitators, cluster school supervisors, WEO staff, and students	267	267	100
2	Conduct village level community mobilization by school directors, teachers, facilitators and other stakeholders	9800	8343	85.1

(Source: Project Annual Report, 2011)

(C) Provision of Materials and School Facilities

Providing different school facilities was another area of project intervention during the third phase of the project. Accordingly, different activities have been carried out by the project. The data in Table 18 below show that the level of achievement for each target in the year 2011 is 100 percent or beyond. For two items (provision of exercise books, pens and pencils and distribution of solid waste disposal), the achievement level is 100 percent. For the remaining two items, however, the level of achievement is 150 percent and 154 percent.

Table 18. Distribution of Materials and School Facilities in 2011

No	Activities	Planned	Accomplished	Achievement (in %)
1	Provide children in the ABE centers, primary school children and ECD children with exercise books, pens and pencils	1500 exercise books, 3000 pencils and pens	1500 exercise books, 3000 pencils and pens	100
2	Furnish and equip ECD centers	2	3	150
3	Distribution of solid waste disposal	6	6	100
4	Appropriately selected books provided to schools and ABE centers	500	771	154

3.2. Discussion

3.2.1. Relevance of the Project

The findings clearly show that the project was relevant in that it addressed the needs of the children in Hamer woreda. Before launching SCN-E's project, there were only few schools and these could not address the needs of all children in the woreda. The results also showed that once the project was launched in 2005, all constructions were made possible because of the project. Focusing only on the second project period (2008-2010), one can observe that the project constructed 21 ABE centers, eight lower primary schools, one upper primary school, and seven ECD centers. The project has thus supported the government in improving access to school age children in a remote, pastoralist woreda where access to primary education had been very limited before SCN-E's project intervention.

Because of the new constructions, a substantial increase in student enrolment was registered through the years and the number of children in both ECD and ABE centers as well as in primary schools reached 5018 at the end of 2010. This provides clear evidence that the project was relevant for the pastoralist communities in Hamer.

In addition to primary schools, the project has constructed ABE centers and this appeared to have considered the needs of many children who cannot attend formal schools because they are required to look after the cattle and goats/sheep. The construction of ABE centers has therefore special meaning to the education of school age children in Hamer woreda by ensuring an alternative mode of delivery that considered the real needs of the community and the children. In short, the ABE centers along with the primary schools and ECD centers make the project highly relevant to the needs of the pastoralist community in general and the children in particular.

The project's relevance can further be seen from the perspective of improving the community's awareness in relation to the value of education. The results indicated that the project has improved the community's awareness which in turn helped the community to develop positive attitudes toward children's education. Apart from this, the project has supported both preschool and school age children through the school health and nutrition component. As a result, many of the children were treated for trachoma and worms which helped them to attend school.

3.2.2. Efficiency of the 2008-2010 Project

Efficiency of the project was examined in terms of time and financial efficiency. The results suggest that the project has completed several of its plans according to schedule whereas some other plans were not completed on time. The construction of the ECD center in Shanko and the upgrading of two primary schools, among others, were elements in the plan which were not completed as per the schedule.

Examination of the project reports and the data obtained through interviews suggest that there were several factors that disturbed the smooth execution and completion of planned activities. One such factor is the remoteness of Hamer woreda. Associated with this factor, there are no all weather roads. This makes transportation to the woreda difficult. Even though the road is under construction, it is not yet complete. During the fieldwork, the consultants have witnessed firsthand several bridges under construction and several of them complete but not yet functional.

In the absence of all weather roads to Hamer woreda, it would be difficult to transport heavy construction materials to the project sites. What makes this problem even worse is the rainy season. During this season, there are often heavy rains and transportation would be more challenging. In addition to transportation problems that hindered timely completion of planned activities, the financial disbursement procedure employed by the Hamer woreda finance office had negatively contributed to the timely execution of planned activities. Because the procedure took unnecessarily long time to purchase materials, timely implementation of planned activities has suffered accordingly. Given these problems, it would not be surprising that several of the planned activities could not be completed on time. In general terms, the project was fairly efficient in terms of time but because the project site is remote and all weather roads are absent, it could not complete some of its plans according to the schedule.

Two important points emerged from the examination of the financial efficiency of the project. On the one hand, the project has utilized slightly more than twice as much money as originally planned (the originally planned budget was Birr 10,871210 whereas the project actually utilized Birr 22,864,554.00). On the other hand, the project has achieved beyond its targets. For example, the number of primary schools and ECD and ABE centers actually constructed by the project are larger than the ones in the original plan.

Further examination of the project's financial utilization indicate that out of the total 22,864,554.00 Birr spent during the project's period (2008-2010), the largest budget share (71%) was utilized for

construction: construction of ECD centers, ABE centers, primary schools, reading rooms, and hostels. This implies that more emphasis was given to improving access. In a woreda where there were only two full primary schools (grades 1-8) and five lower primary schools (grades 1-4) before SCN-E's intervention, allocating the largest proportion of the budget for construction and increasing access appears to be logical.

3.2.3. Effectiveness of the 2008-2010 Project

The results indicated that the project has accomplished almost all planned activities although there was some delay in delivering the final outputs on time: constructions, capacity building activities, distribution of equipment, furniture and materials, and community mobilization to mention just a few. Besides, the project has achieved beyond its targets although again it has utilized more budget than originally planned.

One can say that the project was very effective in achieving its targets in the area of constructions, capacity building and provision of equipment, furniture and other materials to schools and centers. Besides, one may say that the project was fairly effective in the area of community mobilization.

Regarding the construction of schools and ECD and ABE centers, most of the community members and children that the consultants talked to particularly those in rural areas are happy and satisfied. The constructions will have contributions in creating favorable learning environment to the children. These constructions would also help to reduce disparities between semi-urban and rural areas because they are constructed in both locations. In other words, the schools and the centers are fairly distributed across the woreda. It is further clear that the construction of schools and centers reduce the distance children travel to get schools. Overall, one can say that the project was highly effective in the construction of schools, centers, and latrines, among other things.

In relation to capacity building, the project has accomplished several activities. Most respondents including teachers, facilitators PTA members, parents and even students positively evaluated the training sessions, the equipment, or furniture and materials provided to the schools. Several ECD facilitators, for example, have appreciated the only training they took at Turmi organized by the project which opened opportunities for their employment.

One challenge that the Hamer WEO faced in relation to building the capacity of teachers is that most teachers who participated in such capacity building activities leave the woreda without giving much service. In fact, this is also a serious concern for the current project which focuses on improving quality of basic education in Hamer woreda. If many of the teachers who received different trainings leave the woreda and if they are replaced by new and less experienced teachers, the effort being exerted to improve quality will be at stake. Thus, there is a need to study and design measures that help the woreda to retain trained and experienced teachers in the woreda at least for some time. In one sense, if trained teachers leave the woreda shortly after they receive training, it would be wastage for the project. In other words, it would not be cost effective for the project to train teachers and see them leave the woreda. All these point to the need for working seriously on teacher retention. .

Another area of effectiveness of the project is the increase in enrollment of students as a result of the project's efforts. The project was effective in increasing enrollment from only 1000 children in 2004 to 1978 in 2007 and to 5018 in 2010. The growth rate represents 267 percent and this outcome is appreciable. However, one shall ask further questions to understand the matter in-depth. Do all children in each village attend school? Is there real change in the community's perception about education?

In response to the above questions, it would suffice to see an example from one school. In Boriya Primary School only 57 students (in Grades 1-4) are registered and are attending school in 2004 E.C. However, this was not unique only to 2004 E.C. The corresponding numbers for the years 2000-2003 E.C. were 43, 72, 51 and 52, respectively. The number of students in each class is very small (between 10 and 20 only). Given that there are so many children that have not been sent to school yet, one would not be satisfied with such enrolment statistics. Besides, as shown in the recently published Education Statistics Annual Abstract for SNNPR (SNNPR Education Bureau, 2011), the average number of students in one section (that is, student-section ratio for Grades 1-4) for both South Omo Zone as well as for SNNPR was 64 in 2002 E.C. This simply means that the classrooms were underutilized; they could have served at least three times as many students as the enrolment in 2002 E.C.

This suggests that although there are changes in the perceptions of the pastoralist communities in Hamer woreda regarding the value of education, the change appears to be slow. Most of the interviewees have emphasized that the pastoralist communities in Hamer send not all of their children to school. In fact, parents who send a child or two to the school would courageously speak about themselves as a "generous" contributor even though they have not sent all their children to school. It is often the case

that in each household, there are at least two or three children who would not go to school because they look after the cattle and the goats. While working with the children in schools, the project shall continue to work on educating and sensitizing the community on the value of education in an effort to bring lasting changes in parental attitudes.

In relation to community mobilization, the findings indicate that the project was effective in successfully implementing its plans. In some cases, the project has accomplished even beyond its targets. In general, the project has accomplished so much and the level of achievement should be appreciated. The consultants would like to emphasize, however, that numbers would not tell the whole story in such undertakings. One may reach as many as millions and conduct sensitization and educational programs of different kinds. We may be satisfied with this accomplishment. But we should also ask ourselves several questions. Did we achieve our objectives in aspects other than number? Were we able to change how the community perceives education? Did the community members internalize the important ideas and values conveyed in the educational programs? Or do community members attend such programs simply because they are required to do so but do not show any changes in their actual behavior?

One cannot deny that there are changes registered in Hamer Woreda as a result of the SCN-E's project. The changes are reflected in several areas such as enrolment of school age children in primary schools and ABE centers, preschool children in ECD centers and changes in the knowledge and attitudes of children, to mention just a few. Despite these desirable changes, there are still some areas that require strong effort, more sensitization programs, and hard work on the part of key stakeholders.

One clear fact, for example, is that the pastoralist communities in Hamer are still reluctant to send their children to school. Actually, they send one or two children. But they consider this as a contribution perhaps to the achievement of the government's goals, not as something of value to the children and to themselves. This has been voiced by several interviewees and FGD participants including teachers, facilitators and parents themselves. Besides, even though there are several children in each household, it seems less likely to find a family that sends all the children in the family to school.

In sum, it appears that the pastoralist communities in Hamer have not yet fully internalized the value of sending children to school in general and girls in particular. As indicated earlier, it is obvious that not all children in each household are going to school. At least two children, who should have been in school, are obliged to look after the cattle (usually an older son's role) and goats and/or sheep. It should be

reiterated that in winning the heart and minds of the pastoralist communities in Hamer, SCN-E shall move beyond counting the number of participants in such programs as such. SCN-E must make sure that the programs are appealing to the community and that the programs are presented by successful persons, originally from the communities in Hamer woreda, who hold positions after going through the educational ladder. SCN-E must also move beyond limited and periodic community sensitization programs. The programs shall be implemented on a continuous basis rather than once annually.

Finally, it is important to acknowledge one important factor that helped the project to be effective and efficient. This is the strategic partnership it had with key stakeholders. SCN-E's basic education project in Hamer woreda has benefited considerably from the partnership it created with key stakeholders. The stakeholders included the local communities, Hamer WEO, Hamer WFO, the Dimeka and Turmi Health Centers, the Hamer Woreda Health Office (WHO), and the Hamer Woreda Women and Children's Affairs Office (WWCAO).

One good example is the work the project has accomplished in partnership with Hamer WEO, Hamer WHO and the two health centers in providing de-worming and trachoma treatment with a view to enhancing children's intellectual development in general and improving children's school performance in particular. The project in collaboration with the stakeholders distributed drugs (albendazol, mebendazol, and eye ointment) across all health posts in Hamer Woreda and the school children benefited from the drugs. Finally, the project has further worked in partnership with the Hamer Woreda Women and Children's Affairs Office in an effort to sensitize community members of harmful traditional practices. The partnership it had with the stakeholders appeared to have helped the project to perform its planned activities efficiently.

3.2.4. Impact of the Project

The project has several observable impacts in the woreda. One example is the increase in the number of children who are attending school not only in towns as it used to be before the project's intervention but also in rural areas. In almost every angle of the woreda there are either formal schools, ABE centers or/and ECD centers. As a result, children would not go far away to get schools. Because of the schools and the centers, there are now more children attending school than in the past.

There is also visible impact on young children who are staying at the ECD centers. Apart from learning about the alphabets and numeracy, the kids have developed interest to be in school. In fact, the biscuits and tea they get at the centers have helped to develop their interest to stay in the centers. According to some facilitators, the children who are in the ECD centers are more likely to remain in school than other children who are not in ECD centers.

One can also see positive changes in school age children who are now attending school in the different angles of the woreda. Apart from the education they are pursuing, the children participate in several clubs and extracurricular activities. As a result, they have now positive attitudes toward education of children in general and that of girls in particular. Their knowledge on several issues including harmful traditional practices, HIV/AIDS, child rights and environmental protection is generally good as exhibited through the responses they gave to questions raised in FGDs.

Furthermore, the project has impacts on teachers, facilitators, parents and the community at large. The impact on teachers and facilitators resulted from the project's capacity building schemes. For example, some facilitators had the chance to upgrade their professional status through attending formal training in Arba Minch Teacher Education College. They have now teaching certificate and some are even studying for their diploma. On the other hand, teachers who are certified have received training on several useful topics like continuous assessment, lesson plan preparation and classroom management. Most teachers feel that the training was useful in improving their teaching skills and confidence.

The impact of the project on community members, though slow, is observable in several ways. One example is the community's participation. The community better participates now than before in matters concerning education of children and the schools and centers. There is no doubt, as indicated earlier, that changing the community's attitudes toward education of children in Hamer requires concerted effort and conducting periodic/continuous sensitization programs. However, relatively speaking and in comparison with the condition before SCN-E's intervention, at present the community has better attitudes toward the education of children.

3.2.5. Sustainability of the Project

Sustainability of the project (2008-2010) should not be considered a serious issue in this evaluation as the project has continued in its third phase (2011-2013). The focus of this third phase of the project is ensuring the provision of quality education to children. After improving children's access to education

through constructing schools in urban and rural areas, choosing to work on improving quality is logical. Through improving the quality of education, the project may help children and the community at large to internalize the benefits and values of education.

The capacity building (that is, training and experience sharing visits) package has helped to change the way children and community members think about education and other related issues such as HTPs and the education of girls. This will obviously help to sustain the changes at least in the short term.

Looking at institutional sustainability from a different perspective, one can say that SCN-E's project has given emphasis to constructing quality school buildings that will serve the community for a number of years. Construction of the schools and ABE and ECD centers as well as the provision of furniture and equipment would help sustain and enhance the motivation of children and the community at large at least in the short term.

Interviews conducted with several stakeholders including PTA members, WEO staff and the project staff indicated clearly that there would be no hope in the education sector if SCN-E leaves Hamer woreda at the moment. For one thing, SCN-E seems to be the only NGO that is working on education in the woreda and if it leaves the woreda, it means that there would be no support. Secondly, although the schools and centers are functioning in the government system with SCN-E's technical and financial support, there is no guarantee that the community will continue to send children if the support of SCN-E stops. Fortunately, SCN-E has continued its project in the third phase with particular focus on improving the quality of education. Before the end of the current project, however, SCN-E shall come up with a well thought of plan and exit strategy that ensures sustainability of the project's outputs.

CHAPTER FOUR

CHALLENGES AND LESSONS LEARNED

4.1.Challenges

The participation of children in schools is a function of the interplay between the demand and supply side of education. The demand side factors are further categorized as socio-economic and cultural barriers within the community. The supply factors are related to those government and communities' supports to provide education. In this regard, the challenges affecting children's education in Hamer woreda are multifaceted. Most of these problems are associated with the socio-economic and cultural challenges within the society while others are related to institutional problems. Each is discussed below.

(A) Socio-Economic Problems

The Demand for Child Labor

Among the different socio-economic problems that affect children's learning is the demand for child labor. Agriculture, particularly herding is the main stay of the pastoralists in Hamer Woreda. Herding cattle on the other hand is a labor intensive activity to the pastoralists as they go far to look for grazing and water. Hence, children are the main contributors to the household income through their labor, even from an early age and seen by their parents as an economic asset of their families. Children are highly needed by pastoral parents for their labor to look after the cattle rather than to go to school. Traditional societies like the pastoralists in Hamer woreda always look into the opportunity costs of educating their children. In rural areas parents always see the immediate benefits or returns from the labor of their children. As returns from education require longer years to come, pastoral parents always prefer their children to look after their cattle than to attend schools which they think is better investment than education.

The case below clearly indicates that the demand for child labor is one of the major reasons why most Hamer children in the woreda are not enrolled in schools. Pastoral children particularly girls also assist their mothers to fetch water and fire wood, look after babies at home, and carry out other duties in the farm. Consequently, they are not allowed to go to school by their parents because of the labor demand. The FGDs and interviews we conducted with different groups indicated that the demand for child labor

is the major reason why parents do not send their children to school. Thus, the demand for child labor is a challenge to provide basic education in the woreda.



The above photo was taken by one of the consultants while visiting Shanko Complete Primary School constructed by the project in one of the rural areas. On the way, we met the three armed teenagers seen in the photo and asked them if they attend school. They replied that they have never been to school due to their parents' demand for their labor. What was interesting about the boys was that they were looking after the cattle very close to the school suggesting that sometimes it is not only distance that matters.

Dispersed Settlements of the Pastoralists in Hamer Woreda

Pastoralists in Hamer Woreda are settled very far apart from each other for various reasons. One of the reasons could be the demand for wide farmland or spaces for cattle breading in the rural areas. The other problem that was mentioned in different FGDs is fear of conflict with some neighbouring ethnic groups in the nearby woredas. According to most of the respondents, Hamer pastoralists think that when they are close to one another in rural areas, there is a high probability/possibility to be encircled and attacked by their enemies. Thus, they prefer to settle far apart from each other to defend their enemies. But when

communities are dispersed in their settlements, it is difficult to plan and provide services like education. Thus, the construction of different educational institutions that could serve all rural communities is very challenging to the Government as well as to NGOs like SCN-E. Hence, the way of settlement of the pastoralists in the woreda would hinder the children's learning, where remote areas do not get access to schools in their localities. On top of this, pastoralists' mobility from place to place particularly during the dry season searching for pasture is also one of the challenges hindering children's participation in education in Hamer Woreda.

(B) Socio-Cultural Problems

Different sensitization and awareness creation activities have been conducted to change the traditional views and outlooks of the pastoralists by the project in Hamer woreda. Yet, there are different cultural barriers that hinder the education of pastoral children in the woreda. The following are some of these challenges observed in the evaluation.

Parents' Negative Attitudes toward Education (that of Elder Sons and Daughters in particular)

Parents in Hamer woreda consider education as something that spoils or destroys their culture by making their children act out of the norm for the community or against their culture. Definitely education changes the life of people, by changing the way people think, act, decide, etc. Besides, pastoralists do not want to send the elder son of the family and their daughters due to cultural traditions. The Hamer pastoral families consider an elder son to be the heir who inherits the wealth of the family, and becomes a leader after bull jumping ceremony. The following two cases of elder sons who were approached and interviewed by the consultants serve as evidence for this.

Case 1: Atalo Arbala



Atalo Arbala is 18 and an elder son for his family. He explains the problems he faced in the family because of his being an elder son to go to school in his own words as follows.

My parents first sent my younger brother to school but forced me to look after the cattle. Then, I asked them to send me to school too. However, my question was rejected as an elder son is expected to inherit the wealth, and become head of the family in the absence of his father. I have decided to go to school with my own decision and discussed with teachers to ask my parents to send me to school. The teachers went to our home and asked my parents to send me to school. Their response, however, was negative and instead warned them not to come back, and if found enroll him in school, the penalty could be harsh. I immediately realized that there is no means to change their mind. Then, I have agreed with my parents to look after goats than the cows, as the former will not go far for grazing. Then I discussed with other neighboring children looking after their goats to give them some food that I will be given from my parents, look after our goats together, and keep the secret between us on the matter. This way I started my primary education and stood first from the class in first and second grades without the knowledge of my parents. During school closing ceremony in the second grade, however, my parents were invited to attend the ceremony and saw me being awarded. Then, they realized my potential and interest and allowed me to continue my education. Yet, I was requested to carryout bull jumping while I was in grade three as an elder son and I did. Then after I became independent and free to decide on my own. This has helped me to send two of my younger brothers to school and we are here together. Now I am in grade seven and would like to become a teacher in the future.

Case 2: Eyob Tafesse



Eyob Tafesse who is 16 has similar experiences as Atalo Arbala and tells his story as follows.

I'm an elder son for the family. I was also the first to go to school in the family. When my younger son reached the age of seven, however, I was asked not to go to school any more and to send my brother to school instead. An elder son is expected to inherit the wealth of the family and become head after bull jumping ceremony. When my parents raised this issue, I talked to my teachers if there are possibilities of continuing my schooling while looking after the goats at the same time. Although my teachers permitted me to continue through this arrangement, my parents were not happy. They told me to leave home soon. Again I went to my teachers and told them my problem. Understanding my problem and my interest and enthusiasm for education, they allowed me to live with them and pursue my education. With all these problems I stood first in my class and was promoted to the next grade. When my mother saw my grades at the end of the academic year, she convinced my father and I rejoined the family while continuing my schooling. Now I am in grade seven and hope to become a medical doctor in the future.

The above two cases provide evidence for the negative attitude of the Hamer pastoralists toward sending their elder sons to school due to traditional roles expected from the latter in the community. Once enrolled in school and agree to perform bull jumping ceremony as in the first case, however, it is the son who decides on matters related to the family. Once this elder son is convinced about the importance of education, he would be the one who would decide on the education of the remaining children in the family. The story in the second case further shows the significance of convincing mothers that their children's education is important.

The Dowry System

Females are considered as a wealth of the family among pastoral parents in Hamer woreda. This is because of the dowry system. When daughters are married, their parents get many cows, goats, sheep, honey, etc. in return. If girls are sent to school, however, Hamer parents think that they will lose the wealth they would get from the dowry system as educated girls marry anyone after education. In one of the FGDs conducted with parents, respondents indicated what a rural parent said in relation to sending his daughter. According to the respondents, he said "if there is a parent who wants to send his son, I will send my daughter to school" so that they could marry each other. However, it is not only the dowry system that hinders girls' education in Hamer woreda. It is parents' fear that educated Hamer girls could marry males from other ethnic groups, which they think would destroy their identity and culture. These and other related beliefs about girls' education in the community hinder girls' participation in schools in Hamer woreda.

(C) Institutional Challenges

SCN-E is the only NGO operating in the area of education in the woreda since 2005. It has allocated huge amount of money to construct schools, ABE and ECD centers. Besides, the organization provided different equipment and facilities to improve the quality of education offered in these schools and centers. The quality of the institutions constructed with their teaching facilities is far better than at least some of those found in the capital, Addis Ababa. Different capacity building activities have been conducted since the project has started to operate in the woreda to empower teachers, school administrators and the community at large to manage these institutions on their own. Apart from these and other related activities carried out to promote the quality of education for the pastoral children, there are still some institutional challenges that hinder pastoral children's learning in the woreda. Some of these challenges are discussed below.

Teachers' Behavior

Teachers play the major role in enhancing children's learning in schools. They are the nearest persons to children. They are the most important of all resources in schools in providing quality education. When teachers are poorly trained, lack interest and enthusiasm in their profession, and become dissatisfied, they fail to fulfill the roles and duties expected of them. This in turn influences the quality of education provided in schools, affect children's attitude to education and results in students' repetition and drop out from schools. The majority of classroom observations conducted in the ECDs, ABE centers and primary schools visited show the need to train teachers to provide quality education. The challenges observed, among others, were the use of corporal punishment on children including very young children in the ECDs, ABE centers and primary schools, poor classroom presentations of subject matter taught, and teacher centered approach of teaching.

Children and parents who participated in FGDs underscored that children drop out of school due to teachers' poor classroom management. In one sample school (Shanko primary school), children were asked if they know anyone who dropped out of school in the current academic year. In response, they stated that they know two children who dropped out due to teachers' poor classroom management. According to the participants, the two children passed the whole night on "evangadi" (cultural gathering for dancing) and came in the morning without doing their homework. After asking their reasons for not doing their homework the teacher tried to use corporal punishment against the two children which they refused and went back to herding. Teachers teaching in schools for pastoral children, like those in

Hamer woreda, need to understand that these children are enrolled in schools after overcoming so many challenges affecting their life to come to school. When these children are mistreated and disregarded by their teachers, they will run out of school and go back to their most preferred life. It is like adding fuel on fire. Teachers in these schools should be able to handle the children more carefully.

High Staff Turnover in Hamer Woreda

School principals, teachers, woreda education and project experts interviewed for this evaluation underlined the point that high staff turnover has become the major problem in the woreda. The problem of staff turnover is observed both in project schools and Hamer WEO. Several trained teachers as well as WEO staff have left their profession and joined other better paying sectors. Particularly when higher officials, who have been leading the project, leave their positions and replaced by new ones, this would affect the smooth implementation of the project as the new comers need some time to understand the project and its activities.

4.2. Lessons Learned

SCN-E is a pioneer to increase Hamer pastoral children's access to basic education in the woreda. Different activities have been planned and accomplished by the project to achieve its general and specific objectives. In the course of the project implementation, the following lessons that could be replicated by other similar projects in other parts of the country are documented.

(A) Investing on ECD

Early childhood education is one of the intervention areas of SCN-E's basic education project in Hamer. In the past, early childhood education is said to be an urban phenomenon in Ethiopia. This project has, however, changed this fact by constructing ECD centers in different rural areas of Hamer woreda. Early childhood education is said to be a foundation for a child's later developments. Early socialization is crucial for children. The children learn through play in the ECD centers. Different sources state that play is an important vehicle for children's physical, social, emotional and cognitive development as well as a reflection of their development. SCN-E has created learning friendly ECD centers which are furnished with basic materials needed in the centers. The following photo shows one of the ECD centers constructed by the project. Each ECD center visited during the fieldwork was found to be well furnished with their own toilets and bathrooms for the kids.



Boriya ECD center with its bathroom (constructed by the project)

Researchers in the area of ECD recommend the field of early childhood education in a holistic approach that supports children's survival, growth, development and learning that includes health, nutrition and hygiene and cognitive, social, physical and emotional development. The ECD centers constructed by the project in the woreda were observed to incorporate these requirements. The centers get water for their bathrooms through tankers that store water to keep the health of the children. In some of the centers a donkey and cart are bought by the project to fetch water for the centers. The centers have their own indoor and outdoor games for the kids to play.



Photo showing children's feeding materials, resting and classrooms

The children are provided with biscuits and this helped to attract more children to the centers. See the following photos taken in the sample ECD centers constructed by the project.



Biscuits and some of the outdoor games in the ECD centers

(B) Changing Traditional Societies is a Slow Process

Different community mobilization and sensitization activities have been carried out to increase parents' awareness on the importance of educating children particularly girls. Notwithstanding, the participation of children particularly girls' participation in education was found to be very low although it is improving from year to year. Parents have started to send their children despite the different challenges they face such as the demand for child labor for herding. Hamer mothers have now started not only sending their children to school; they have started to accompany their children to the nearby school. The following photo shows a Hamer mother accompanying her child to one of the sample schools (Turmi Primary School) the consultants visited during the fieldwork.



Photo. A Hamer mother accompanying her son to Turmi Primary School

However, according to the responses given by different groups of FGD participants, the majority of school age children are still out of school. This suggests that introducing change in traditional societies like pastoral communities in Hamer woreda needs longer period of time, high commitment from change agents, huge and continuous resource mobilization so as to bring the envisaged change. This might be due to the fact that the dissemination of change involves an informal contact of community members to observe, see the results and decide to embark on the change which is a slow process by its nature. Besides, the results of educational changes by their nature further require even longer years. For instance, a minimum of eight years are required for a child to complete full primary education and an additional 2-4 years for secondary education to make the child join further education or get low status jobs in the woreda. Thus, donors and development agencies working on traditional communities to bring change must remain patient; they should not expect an immediate result from such interventions.

CHAPTER FIVE

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1. Conclusion

From the findings presented in the previous sections, one may draw the following conclusion.

In light of the number of schools available in Hamer Woreda before SCN-E's intervention as well as the number of students attending school, the project's plans and achievements were highly relevant to the needs of the pastoralist communities in Hamer Woreda. Unlike its relevance, the project was efficient in some aspects but not in others. Whereas the project has completed several of the planned activities as per the original schedule, it could not finish and deliver some constructions on time. In terms of financial utilization, the project has spent a significant portion of the budget on construction.

The project was found to be effective because it has accomplished most of its planned activities including constructions, capacity building, and provision of equipment and furniture. Some of the activities were accomplished according to plan (that is, with 100 percent level of achievement). In some cases, the project has accomplished beyond its targets.

In relation to impact of the project, the evaluation revealed multifaceted changes in terms of knowledge, attitudes, and behaviors of the key stakeholders including children, teachers, facilitators, parents and the community at large. Because the community is predominantly pastoralist and considers modern education as a threat to the pastoralist culture and tradition, most parents are reluctant to send especially their elder son and daughters to school. Although slow, one cannot deny that there are changes and improvements in the community's perceptions or attitudes, however.

Finally, regarding sustainability, one encouraging feature of the project is that the schools and ECD and ABE centers are functioning already under the Hamer WEO. Besides, the project has continued its third phase focusing on general education quality. This will continue until 2013 and there would be relatively enough time to develop exit strategy that would prepare the stakeholders well ahead of time in owning and sustaining the project's ideals and the impacts which came about because of the project. However, sustainability of the project and its impacts in the long run require much more work in changing the perceptions of the pastoralist communities.

5.2. Recommendations

Based on the findings reported in this evaluation, the consultants put forth the following recommendations.

Improving Enrolment of Students

As shown in the results section, the net enrolment rate for basic education in Hamer woreda was only 24.74 percent. This means that among the school age children for the level (Grades 1-8), only 35.03 percent of the boys and only 13.5 percent of the girls in Hamer woreda were attending school in 2004 E.C. Compared to other woredas in the zone or compared to the South Omo zone average, this was found to be the lowest NER. This implies that much more work needs to be done to improve enrollment rate through community mobilization.

The roles of SCN-E and Hamer WEO

SCN-E can help the education sector to function better by lobbying the regional bureau, South Omo ZED and Hamer WEO and perhaps Hamer Woreda Administration Council too to focus on continuous community mobilization efforts in a bid to improve the community's perception on the education of children in general and that of girls in particular. SCN-E shall use its good relations with officials in the education sector to persuade them about the importance of community mobilization and participation in changing the community's attitudes toward education. Hamer WEO can utilize the local people who are educated and who are working in Hamer woreda at present. It can also work on the youth, provide training to them and utilize them as change agents in community mobilization. It would be difficult to increase enrollment and reduce wastage rates without the community's participation.

Mobilize the Community and Improve Community Participation

Although there are changes in the community particularly in relation to sending children to school, the changes are slow and not satisfactory. This requires much work in sensitizing the community and Hamer WEO needs to design a well thought of measure to improve the community's attitudes toward education. This needs to be done using persons originally from Hamer woreda who became successful because they were educated.

Most of the community members in Hamer woreda, as indicated earlier, do not seem to have favorable attitudes toward education. Even those who have positive attitudes do not send all their children to school. The project needs to exert concerted effort to change this state of affairs through sensitization programs. Several interviewees suggested that if the outcomes of sensitization programs are to be achieved, the project needs to utilize influential people who can easily be heard by community members. According to the Hamer culture, elderly people especially those who used to be land lords are influential and using these people as change agents would be fruitful.

The roles of SCN-E and Hamer WEO

The role of SCN-E shall be to lobby and influence the officials in the education sector from the woreda to regional levels to realize that without the community's participation, separate efforts to develop education in Hamer woreda would not be fully fruitful. Thus, SCN-E should advocate for community mobilization but the actual task of mobilizing the community shall be carried out by Hamer WEO and South Omo ZED in collaboration with the Hamer Woreda Administration Council. In fact, these organs shall utilize different people from the community such as teachers, supervisors and head teachers. Data indicate that in schools where there are committed teachers and head teachers, community participation is far better. Hamer WEO should thus select and use teachers, head teachers and supervisors in community mobilization activities. Hamer Woreda Administration Council can play a significant role in this movement.

Quality of Education and Teachers' Competence: The Need for Periodic Training Programs

The results have shown that teachers' behaviors and handling of children/students have become causes for students' dropout at least in some schools. To avoid such mishaps in the future, there is a need to provide on-the-job training to teachers on classroom management and handling of students. When providing training in these areas, particular emphasis should be placed on positive and proactive methods of disciplining children who often misbehave in class. Teachers should be introduced to methods that are considered alternative to corporal punishment.

Given that the focus of the ongoing project is improving quality of basic education, emphasis should also be placed on organizing periodic on-the-job training for teachers and facilitators in areas such as

general teaching methods, child-centered teaching methods, lesson plan preparation, and preparation of teaching aids from locally available materials. Training of teachers and facilitators is an important first step in improving quality of education.

The roles of SCN-E and Hamer WEO

In organizing the training programs, the major role of SCN-E shall be funding the training programs and finding and assigning resource persons for the different training programs. On the other hand, Hamer WEO together with South Omo ZED and the regional bureau shall identify training areas, identify training centers, select those who should participate in the training programs and follow up and evaluate effectiveness of the training.

Quality of Education and Shortages of Textbooks

Another important issue that must be addressed by the current project is distribution of textbooks and teachers' guides to schools. As indicated earlier, the consultants have been told by several interviewees about serious challenges the schools have faced in the distribution of textbooks. One indicator of quality of education is student-textbook ratio. However, even the school located in the woreda town (that is, Dimeka Primary School) has faced serious shortage of textbooks particularly in the upper grades (grades 7 and 8). For the lower grades (grades 1, 2 and 3), the shortage seems to be less serious at least for some subjects. As the ongoing project focuses on improving quality of education, it should exert effort to alleviate the problem of textbooks and teachers' guides. To this end, the project shall work in collaboration with Hamer WEO, the South Omo ZED, and the education bureau in SNNPR.

The roles of SCN-E and Hamer WEO

The major role of SCN-E shall be to work with Hamer WEO in persuading South Omo ZED and the SNNPR Education Bureau to find out ways of alleviating shortage of textbooks. While this shortage could be overcome easily by working together with officials in the education sector, it may also require publishing at least some of the textbooks. In the latter case, SCN-E shall support the effort financially by funding the printing cost. On the other hand, Hamer WEO and South Omo ZED shall prioritize the books that need to be published and get the selected books published and transported to the different schools on time.

Libraries in Schools but no Librarians

The project has established quality libraries in the schools. These libraries are well furnished for the level (see the pictures below). Yet, the libraries lack trained persons who offer appropriate services to the school community. During the fieldwork, the consultants met a guard who opened the library in one of the project schools (Turmi primary school) so that children can get services. He told us that he opens the library occasionally.



Photo: Reading rooms, chairs, tables, shelves and books in the project's primary schools

Head teachers of other schools visited also reported that they need a librarian to provide services to students and teachers. Because library is a necessary condition in the effort to improve quality of education, SCN-E needs to persuade education officials in Hamer woreda, South Omo ZED and SNNPR Education Bureau about the need for librarians so that the latter understand and take measure to address the problem by assigning trained librarians. One approach could be to train teachers who have the willingness and the interest to give the services. PTAs and management of the schools may need to work out a scheme to compensate the teachers such as exempting them from their teaching assignments in full or in part.

The Role of SCN-E and Hamer WEO

Whereas Hamer WEO shall select volunteer teachers who would like to serve as librarian at least on part-time basis, SCN-E in collaboration with SNNPR education office shall organize training for the teachers to familiarize them with at least the essential tasks of a librarian. SCN-E may also provide financial support that is necessary to organize the training.

Language (or Medium) of Instruction

Another issue concerns the language used as a medium of instruction in schools. There is general agreement that language affects children's acquisition of the basic skills, knowledge and attitude in primary education. Particularly the language used at the early stages of the child's education (that is, the first four years of schooling) is decisive. In Hamer woreda, Amharic is used as a medium of instruction in the ECDs, ABE centers and in primary schools, first cycle (Grades 1 – 4) whereas English is used in primary schools, second cycle (Grades 5 – 8). However, neither of them is a mother tongue for children in the Woreda.

In general, the nature of the language to be used for the acquisition of basic education is still debatable. The supporters of teaching basic education in the local language argue that it increases motivation (or minimizes exclusion) and school productivity. On the other hand, the disadvantages are numerous. Often local languages are only spoken. Defining a written form and producing written materials in a language that may not have a large diffusion involves very high costs.

In cases where different community groups live together, such as SNNPR where more than 45 ethnic or language groups exist, the decision to use mother tongue as medium of instruction for each group must consider both pros and cons. From the pedagogical perspective, however, children must learn in their mother tongue especially in the ECDs, ABE centers, and lower primary grades in the woreda. Thus, it may be appropriate to study if local languages can be adopted for this purpose in Hamer woreda. However, one can easily see that the change of the medium of instruction from Amharic to local language(s) requires preparation of teachers who can teach using the local language(s). At the moment, one cannot get many teachers who speak the local language(s). This requires a period of time sufficient to prepare teachers who can teach in local languages in fact after translation and preparation of the

curricula. It also requires evidence that shows clearly the advantages of using local languages over the ones that are being used now.

Before doing all this, however, there is a need to conduct an in-depth discussion among key stakeholders including children, teachers, and community members. Conducting a study that may clearly show the pros and cons of the languages to be used as well as the preferences of the communities in Hamer woreda will be of considerable help in this regard. Above all, SCN-E has to lobby Hamer WEO, South Omo ZED and SNNPR Education Bureau and advocate for such a change so that these organs consider the matter seriously.

The Role of SCN-E, and Hamer WEO

Here also the role of SCN-E shall be advocacy for the use of mother tongue at least in lower primary grades (Grades 1 – 4) if such use is supported by the proposed study findings, the community, Hamer Woreda Administration Council, South Omo ZED and Administration Council and SNNPR Education Bureau, SNNPR Administration Council as well as policy makers. SCN-E can support this endeavor in other ways including funding the study as well as planning and implementing the translation process if local language is to be used. In fact, Hamer WEO shall take responsibility to oversee the process in general.

The Education of Disadvantaged Children

One area that the project did not focus on in Hamer woreda was the education of disadvantaged children. In traditional communities, it is obvious that the lives of disadvantaged children (e.g., children with disabilities) are full of suffering and discrimination. Parents of these children often believe that the disability is a result of a curse of God. As a result, they are ashamed of the children and do not want to send the children to school.

SCN-E should advocate for general education that is inclusive and for schools that should not discriminate against disadvantaged children. SCN-E shall lobby SNNPR Education Bureau, the South Omo ZED and Hamer WEO so that the schools working under them not only respect the rights of disadvantaged children to have equal opportunities to decent basic education but also educate and sensitize the community to send these children to school. Once the children are school, the school and WEO shall encourage and reward those children with disabilities who continue to come to school. In

fact, they need also to work hard to alleviate the problem of HTPs that tend to prohibit the education of girls. Because the Ministry of Education has adopted Inclusive Education as an approach in the Ethiopian education system, SCN-E can easily persuade the officials in the education sector. The main challenge that should be overcome is changing the community's perception and attitudes toward the education of disadvantaged children.

The roles of SCN-E and Hamer WEO

The role of SCN-E in this endeavor will be advocacy for the rights and education of disadvantaged children. The role of the education bureau, the South Omo ZED and Hamer WEO, on the other hand, shall be to ensure that these children attend school through sensitization programs.

Other issues of advocacy for SCN-E

An important issue that SCN-E shall advocate for is the use of flexible school calendar. As indicated repeatedly in this report, the main challenge in education has been the communities' perception. Changing the attitudes and perceptions of the communities in Hamer may require trying one approach after another until we finally succeed in changing their perceptions. Accordingly, one approach that is worth trying is the use of flexible academic calendar. In fact, this requires conducting a study that examines the mobility patterns of the pastoralists in Hamer woreda. If such a study shows an identifiable pattern of mobility and if we can develop academic calendar that is consistent with their mobility pattern, perhaps we can improve not only dropout rates but also substantially increase enrolment rates. The flexible academic calendar, unlike the fixed one, will minimize wastage rates (dropout and repetition rates) which are caused by the demand for child labor.

The roles of SCN-E and Hamer WEO

In relation to the use of flexible academic calendar, SCN-E can support Hamer WEO in sponsoring the study that will investigate the mobility patterns of the pastoralists in Hamer woreda. Based on the results of the study and the recommendations put forth by the investigators, SCN-E may also advocate for the use of such a calendar and lobby the education offices and the administration council at different levels starting of course from Hamer woreda to the regional bureau and administration council. The role of the education bureau, the South Omo ZED and Hamer WEO, on the other hand, will be to implement the education program according to the new and convenient academic calendar.

Sustainability

The schools constructed by the project are functioning under Hamer WEO. Hamer WEO is therefore primarily responsible for the smooth functioning of the schools and ECD and ABE centers. However, because of shortage of budget, Hamer WEO may not be able to carry out all the tasks that have been done by SCN-E so far. These include training of teachers and facilitators, maintenance of buildings and provision of equipment and educational materials. These require regular budget that should be allocated by the Ministry of Education. It is therefore necessary that Hamer WEO advocate for additional budget from the South Omo ZED and SNNPR Education Bureau for the tasks listed above. SCN-E shall support Hamer WEO in lobbying the South Omo ZED and SNNPR Education Bureau for additional budget. Hamer WEO can also allocate budget from different school improvement programs and other sources to make the project's ideals sustainable in the absence of support from SCN-E in the long run.

References

SNNPR Education Bureau (2011). *Education Statistics Annual Abstract – 2002 E.C. (2009/10)*. SNNPR Education Bureau Data Collection-Dissemination Support Process: Bole Printing Enterprise.

Bhandari, Bishnu, B. (2003). Participatory Rural Appraisal (Module 4). Japan, Hayama, Kanagawa: Institute for Global Environmental Strategies.

ANNEXES

Annex -1

SAVE THE CHILDREN NORWAY – ETHIOPIA HAMER PASTORALIST EDUCATION STATUS EVALUATION FGD Guide (For FGD to be held with Parents, PTAs, CMCs and Education Board Members)

1. Meetings

- Frequency of CEC meetings
- Do you keep records of meetings and issues discussed?
- Who keeps the records?

2. Capacity Building Activities of the Project:

- Have you received any training?
- *What were the training areas?*
- How helpful were the trainings?
- Challenges the PTAs and education boards experienced in their work.
- Community awareness of child rights
- Child Rights promotion and protection – How? Challenges if any?
- How do they see gender issues in schools?
- Effect of HTPs on children, mainly girls. Has this been reduced in the community?

3. Relevance of the Project:

- Members' opinion about the relevance of the project to the learning needs of the children.
Are parents satisfied with the education package offered to the children?
- Identification of new needs that should be attended to

4. Project's Effectiveness:

- Are the targeted children going to school? (*Does this include children with disabilities in the community?*)
- Problems still affecting access, enrollment, participation and retention from the perspective of parents
- Are members of the community participating in the implementation of this project
- Members comment on the performance of teachers (*If they regularly attend to their teaching duties*)

5. Impact of the Project on:

(A). Education Boards and PTAs and parents observation on the impact of the project

- Attitude to education of girls (*To be supported by level of enrollment*)
- Disabled children (*To be supported by presence of disabled children in the school, and disabled friendly school premises*)

- Positive results that parents have noted in their children attending school (*Supporting evidence*)
 - Negative results of the project the parents have noted in the children (*Supporting evidence*)
- (B) Observed change in the general community (Positive or Negative) (Any testimony about these changes)
- Girls' education
 - Child rights issues
 - Harmful Traditional Practices (HTP)
- (C) Testimonies of personal benefits as members of the PTAs and education boards
- Do parents feel that the education their children are getting is helping them as parents?

6. Project Sustainability as seen by FGD Participants

(A) Ownership of the Project

- How does the community regard the project?
- Donor Project
- Community Project (*Evidence to support position*)

(B) Community initiatives toward sustainability

- What the community thinks of the future of the project after end of donor assistance
- Available community resources that could be used to sustain the gains that this project has made?
- Present community preparations to take over the project at the end of donor Assistance

(C) Challenges

- What are the challenges that are likely to affect sustainability?
- How does the community plan to deal with these challenges?

7. Partnership

- Local NGO/Organization, if any, through which the project could be implemented with a view to taking over from SC-N

Annex-2

SAVE THE CHILDREN NORWAY – ETHIOPIA HAMER PASTORALIST EDUCATION STATUS EVALUATION Focus Group Discussion Guide (For the FGD to be held with Hamer Children)

1. Access, Enrollment, and Retention

- (A) Do you know other children of your age who are not going to school?
- (B) If there are children of your age in the villages who are not going to school,
 - What are the reasons given by their counterparts for not going to school?
 - Which one, boys or girls, is most affected by non-enrollment?

2. Attendance

- Learners comment on attendance. (If some are not regular in attendance)
- Reasons for irregular attendance
- Gender most affected by absenteeism

3. Dropout problem

- If they know of classmates who have dropped out?
- Gender most affected
- Known reasons for dropping out

4. Learning Opportunities and Materials

- (A) If learners consider their textbooks are adequate (textbook-student ratio)**
 - If they find content relevant to their needs,
 - Specific supports provided by the project for girls, boys, or for both

(B) Games and sports?

- What sport facilities are available for you?
- How should sport facilities be improved?
- Which games, for example? Do girls also have games facilities?
- Student Clubs in the school. If available, what do they do in these clubs?
- Learners invited to explain what they see as the benefits of these activities.
- Are facilities provided adequately?
- Children participation in clubs

5. School Enrollment and Learner-Teacher Relationships

- (A) What learners like and what they do not like in their school**
 - Explain why you like or do not like what you mentioned.

(B) Attitude of learners toward others

- What learners like and do not like in their teachers, and explain their observations.
- Attitude of boys toward girls
- What do you like most about your school? What you don't like about your school?

(C) To female participants in the FGD

- What did they gain by having female teachers in the school?
- Have they missed anything by not having female teachers? Please explain.
- How did male teachers treat them? Any complaints?
- How did male students treat you? Any complaints?

6. Impact of the Project

(A) What learners see as significant change the project has brought to their lives?

(Personal testimonies on the benefits of the project)

- (B) Any negative change in their lives that they associate with the project
- (C) Suggestions on what they think could be done to improve their school

7. Change in Children's Behavior

(Record children's responses to the following questions. As much as possible, try to capture indicators or evidence to support changes in children's behavior)

- Describe the major environmental challenges in your locality.
- What is HIV/AIDS? Ways of transmission? Methods of protection?
- What are child rights? Describe.
- What are the major HTPs in your locality?
- How do you see education of girls?

Annex -3

SAVE THE CHILDREN NORWAY – ETHIOPIA HAMER PASTORALIST EDUCATION STATUS EVALUATION Guide for the Interview to be held with Zonal, Woreda Education and Administration Officials

- 1.** Rationale and relevance of the Hamer education project in creating:
 - Access to basic education for Hamer pastoralists in the woreda
 - Improving quality of basic education provided for Hamer pastoralists in the woreda by improving the inputs, throughput and output of basic education
 - Creating equity in basic education for Hamer pastoral children in the woreda by minimizing urban vs rural and gender parities
- 2.** What are the different capacity building activities carried out by the project for different stakeholders in the woreda? What are the different inputs and outputs provided by the project in the woreda?
- 3.** What are the different policies and strategies of the government specific to education and pastoralist development addressed, utilized, rolled out to the local government by the project in the woreda?
- 4.** Which of the sub thematic areas: HIV and AIDS, Child Rights programming, Harmful Traditional Practices specific to the area were addressed by the project in the woreda, and how they were addressed by the project in the woreda?
- 5.** What are the specific challenges affecting pastoral children's learning, particularly girls in schools in the woreda?
- 6.** What are the different mechanisms used to implement the project in the woreda?
- 7.** Was there any linkage mechanism developed with other sectors in the implementation of the project? Specific sectors with whom the linkages were created?
- 8. What were the impacts/achievements of the project in the woreda in relation to each of the following?**

(A) Hamer Children

- Changes in children's access to education; increase in enrolment; reduction in gender disparity (boys and girls); changes in boys' attitudes to girls' education; what have been observable children's participation

(B) Hamer parents and the community

- WEO's assessment of response of targeted communities
- What evidences have been perceived as impact on communities?
(For example, if community's attitude to education of girls has changed)
- What lesson has ZED/WEO learnt from the experiences?
- If the ZED/WEO has been monitoring participation and progress of children, *(Comment on quality of education the children are receiving)*

(C) Impact on Teachers

- Reports of REO monitoring of teachers performance as evidence of impact *(Is quality noted in the monitoring reports?)*

- Assessment of role being played by female teachers in the schools

(D) Impact on Education Managers

- If ZEO monitors the work of Supervisors (Evidence of improved performance of ZED/WEO and Supervisors following their training)
- Comment on quality of management by head teachers
- What do the ZED/WEO officials say they are now able to do better as a result of capacity building by the project?
- If there is still problem of management capacity at all levels examined

(E) Capacity of PTAs and education boards

- Have PTAs and education boards received any capacity building/awareness raising training? What were the major components of training provided to the PTAs and education boards?
- Do PTAs and education boards appear to understand their roles?
- What has been noted in their work that shows the impact of the project?

(F) Unplanned Results

- ZEO/WEO to identify any results of this project that, in their view, were not originally envisaged

(G) Negative Results

- In general, have there been any negative results from this project? If so, please explain?

9. What are the challenges and lessons learned from the project?

(A) Challenges

- What are the challenges that have been experienced in the course of implementing this project?
- How have these challenges been dealt with?

(B) Lessons learned

- What lessons have been learned in the course of implementation so far that should benefit the project beneficiaries?
- What should be taken into account in the event of implementing a similar project in a different location in the country?

10. Sustainability of the Project

(A) What do you think will happen when the project phases out in the future?

- What is expected to happen?
- Will there be any opportunity to sustain the project by the ZEO/WEO?
- Give us some evidence if you can.
- Does the zone or woreda have the capacity to ensure sustainability of the project?

(B) Sustainability Initiatives

- What has been done now at the ZEO/WEO level to ensure sustainability of the project?
- How do you see the trend of financial allocation to basic education program between 2008/09 and 2010?

- What is the woreda education office and woreda government doing for the empowerment of communities to sustain the gains of this project?
- In what specific ways can the ZED/WEO capacity be strengthened for sustainability of the project?

11. Are there other educational demands that are not met by the project in the woreda?

Yes _____ No _____

If yes, please list what you think are the unmet educational needs.

Annex 4

SAVE THE CHILDREN NORWAY – ETHIOPIA
HAMER PASTORALIST EDUCATION STATUS EVALUATION
SCHOOL FACILITIES OBSERVATION CHECKLIST

Name of Primary School _____ Location (Urban/Rural) _____ Date _____

NO.	FACILITY OBSERVED	OBSERVATION REMARKS
1	Learning Facility <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Type of building (mud, hollow block and concrete, etc.) • Inside Classrooms: General conditions (light, dusty or concrete, etc.) • Suitability of learning environment for children with disabilities (Is the learning environment friendly for children with disabilities?) • Library 	
2	Classroom Furniture <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Seating Condition (desks, locally made wooden seats, floor mats, etc) • Learning resources (chalkboard, pictures, charts, maps, etc) • Availability of teachers' tables and chairs • Quality of desks in terms of durability, comfort, attractiveness 	
3.	Sanitary Facilities <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provision of separate latrines for girls and boys • Provision for teachers • Availability of water • General condition of sanitary facilities 	
4	Availability of Storage space	
5	Administration (Head teacher's office) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Furniture • Storage for documents/record keeping • Staff room facilities 	
6	School compound <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Play grounds: Outdoor games facilities • Play materials (e.g., ball) • Plantation: flowers and trees • Security (Fencing) • Child friendliness of the school environment 	
7	General Remark	

Annex-5

SAVE THE CHILDREN NORWAY – ETHIOPIA HAMER PASTORALIST EDUCATION STATUS EVALUATION LESSON DELIVERY OBSERVATION CHECKLIST

Name of Primary School _____ Location (Urban/Rural) _____

Year of Establishment _____

Class/Grade Observed _____ Date _____ Time: From _____ To _____

Number of Pupils Enrolled: Boys _____ Girls _____ Total _____

Number of Pupils Present for the Lesson: Boys _____ Girls _____ Total _____

Subject _____ Topic _____ Sex of the Teacher _____

NO.	ITEM ASSESSED	REMARKS (Satisfactory or Not satisfactory and Evidence or Example)
1	Planning the Process Scheme of Work (If Available) Components of Lesson Plan (If Available) <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Statement of Objectives (If SMART)• Teaching/Learning Resources (If Available)• Quality	
2	Lesson Delivery <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Ways Content Treated• Method used (If Effective)• Lesson sequencing• Class Interaction• Gender sensitivity• Motivation• Audibility/Clarity of Voice• Managing learning time• Conclusion of Lesson	
3	Use of Instructional Resources (e.g., Chalkboard) <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Effectively used/Not effectively used	
4	Teacher's Personal Qualities <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Mannerisms• Mastery of content and Confidence	
5	General Remarks	

Annex - 6

SAVE THE CHILDREN NORWAY – ETHIOPIA HAMER PASTORALIST EDUCATION STATUS EVALUATION Questionnaire to be Completed by Principals, Teachers, ABE and ECD Facilitators

Part I: Background Characteristics of Respondents

- 1.1. Name of school/ABE center/ECD _____
- 1.2. Year of establishment _____
- 1.3. Sex of respondent: Male _____ Female _____ 1.4. Age of the Respondent _____
- 1.5. Current Position: Principal _____ Teacher _____ ABE facilitator _____
(D) ECD teacher _____ (E) Other, please specify _____
- 1.6. Work experience in years: Present Position _____ Other Positions _____ Total _____

Part II: Questions Related to Hammer Pastoralist Education Project Activities

- 2.1. When did the Hammer Pastoralist Education Project start to support your school? _____
- 2.2. What were the different supports provided to your school by the project in the last three academic years?

- 2.3. How satisfactory, do you think, are the impacts of the project in changing conditions existing before the commencement of the project?

	Very High	High	Average	Low	Very Low
Created access to basic education for Hamer pastoral children in the woreda					
Created access to basic education for Hamer girls					
Reduced distance travelled to get access to basic education for Hamer children					
Reduced students' dropouts from schools					
Reduced students' repetition from schools					
Improved Hamer children's academic achievements in schools					

- 2.4. What was the **average distance travelled** by Hamer children to reach the nearest primary school in the woreda?

- Before the commencement of the project _____ kilometers
- After the commencement of the Project _____ kilometers

- 2.5. Did you get any training program from the project? Yes _____ No _____
- 2.6. If yes for the above question, in what areas did you receive the training?

2.7. If yes for question 2.5. please indicate your overall evaluation of the training with respect to the issues indicated in the table.

	Very High	High	Average	Low	Very Low
Relevance of the training to your daily activities					
Appropriateness of training contents to your daily activities					
Appropriateness of the training methods to you					
Competence of the trainers who offered the trainings					
Appropriateness of the training time offered to you					

2.8. Do you need additional training program? Yes _____ No _____

2.9. If Yes for the above question, list down areas of training you need?

2.10. Which one of the following input related activities has been carried out by the project in your school/ABE center, ECD School?

<i>Activities Related to inputs</i>	<i>Yes</i>	<i>No</i>
School construction		
Upgrading ABE center		
Construction of ECD school		
Furnishing the school/ABE center/ECD school		
Construction of hand dug well		
Construction of latrine		
Play grounds		
Separate toilet for girls		
Outdoor games		
Reading rooms		
Introduced inclusive education		
Conducted community mobilization		
Implemented SHN		
Created gender sensitive friendly school environment for girls		
Provided reading materials for children		
Textbooks for teachers		
Teacher's Guide		
Textbooks for children		
Awareness creation on child rights		
Awareness creation on HIV and AIDS		
Awareness creation on harmful traditional practices		

2.11. In your opinion, are there changes or improvements registered in your locality due to the inputs provided to the school/ABE center/ ECD School?

Area of Improvement	Yes	No
Improved access to basic education for Hamer pastoral children		
Improved quality of basic education provided		
Improved Hamer girls' participation in school		
Created equity in basic education		
Reduced students dropouts in schools		
Improved children's academic performances		
Improved children's awareness on child rights		
Improved children's awareness on the issues related to HIV and AIDS		
Improved children's awareness on harmful traditional practices		
Improved community's/parents awareness on child rights		
Improved community's/parents awareness on the issues related to HIV and AIDS		
Improved community's/parents awareness on harmful traditional practices		
Improved community's/parents awareness on the importance of girls' education		
Improved Teachers awareness on child rights		
Improved Teachers awareness on the issues related to HIV and AIDS		
Improved Teachers awareness on harmful traditional practices		

2.12. In your opinion, have the project's activities addressed Hamer pastoral community children's demand for quality basic education? Yes _____ No _____

2.13. In your opinion, are there other unmet educational demands of Hamer pastoral children in the woreda? Yes _____ No _____

2.14. If yes for the above question No. 2.13, list those unmet educational demands that should be addressed in the future in the woreda?

2.15. What is your overall evaluation of the sustainability of project activities? Do you think the community can own and sustain the activities in the absence of the donor?

- How do you evaluate the community's Attitude towards project activities?

- How do you evaluate the financial capacity of the community?

- How do you evaluate the managerial capacity of the community?

2.16. Are there any sustainability measures that are being undertaken by the community, local administration, etc, to own the activities after donor withdrawal? Yes _____ No _____

- If yes, please list the measures that are being undertaken.

2.17. Please describe your overall assessment of the project's contributions to Hamer pastoral children, community, teachers, etc.

2.18. What is your overall assessment of the project's relevance to Hamer pastoral children, community, and teachers?

2.19. What were the major strengths of the project?

2.20. What were the major weaknesses of the project?

2.21. Please describe your overall recommendations to improve the project's activities.

Annex- 7

SAVE THE CHILDREN NORWAY – ETHIOPIA
HAMER PASTORALIST EDUCATION STATUS EVALUATION
Secondary Data to be collected from Hamer Woreda Education Office,
Administration and Sample Schools

1. School Age Children by Sex in the Woreda

1.1. Children Aged 4-6

Age	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
4								
5								
6								
Total								

1.2. Children Aged 7-14 (School Age Children)

Age	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
7								
8								
9								
10								
11								
12								
13								
14								
Total								

2. Children Enrolled in Schools

2.1. Children enrolled in ECD centers

Age	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
4								
5								
6								
Total								

2.2. Children Enrolled in the ABE centers

Level	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
I								
II								
III								
Total								

2.3. Children enrolled in primary Schools by Age

Age	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
7								
8								
9								
10								
11								
12								
13								
14								
Total								

2.4. Children enrolled in primary Schools by grade and Academic year

Grade	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
1								
2								
3								
4								
5								
6								
7								
8								
Total								

3. Total Number of Teachers in the project Schools/ABE centers and ECDs

School	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
ECD centers								
ABE centers								
Primary Schools								
Total								

4. Student Dropout in project schools

4.1. Student dropout in ECDs

Ages	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
4								
5								
6								
Total								

4.2. Student Dropout in ABE Centers by Academic year

Level	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
I								
II								
III								
Total								

4.3. Student Dropout in Primary Schools by grade level

Grade	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
1								
2								
3								
4								
5								
6								
7								
8								
Total								

5. Repetition Rates in project Schools

5.1. Repetition rates in ECDs

Age	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
4								
5								
6								
Total								

5.2. Repetition rates in the ABE centers

Level	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
I								
II								
III								
Total								

5.3. Repetition rates in primary schools

Grade	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
1								
2								
3								
4								
5								
6								
7								
8								
Total								

6. Number of Returnees in Project Schools

6.1. Number of Returnees in ECDs

Ages	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
4								
5								
6								
Total								

6.2. Number of Returnees in the ABE centers

Level	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
I								
II								
III								
Total								

6.3. Number of Returnees in Primary Schools

Grade	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
1								
2								
3								
4								
5								
6								
7								
8								
Total								

7. Total Number of Teachers in the project Schools/ABE centers and ECDs

School	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
ECD centers								
ABE centers								
Primary Schools								
Total								

8. Teachers' Attritions in project Schools/ABE Centers and ECDs

School	2001		2002		2003		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
ECD centers								
ABE centers								
Primary Schools								
Total								

Annex-8

SAVE THE CHILDREN NORWAY – ETHIOPIA HAMER PASTORALIST EDUCATION STATUS EVALUATION

MATHEMATICS TEST FOR GRADE FIVE

Name _____ Sex _____ Age _____

School's Name _____ Cluster Center _____

I. TRUE-FALSE ITEMS (10 POINTS)

DIRECTIONS: For each of the following statements, write **TRUE** if you think the statement is correct or **FALSE** if you think the statement is not correct in the blank space provided.

_____ 1. $\frac{9}{10}$ is greater than $\frac{7}{10}$.

_____ 2. $\frac{3}{4}$ is equivalent to $\frac{9}{12}$.

_____ 3. $0.7 + 0.5 = 0.12$.

_____ 4. Three thousand two hundred and five, written in words, is 325.

_____ 5. In the numeral 432, the place value of 4 is hundreds.

_____ 6. When $\frac{3}{5} + \frac{2}{5} = \frac{5}{5} = 1$.

_____ 7. On the number line, any decimal which is located to the left is always less than a decimal which is located to the right.

_____ 8. $0.5 > 0.7$.

_____ 9. $0.53 > 0.54$.

_____ 10. $5 \times 5 \times 5 \times 5 = 10 \times 10$.

II. MULTIPLE-CHOICE ITEMS (10 POINTS)

DIRECTIONS: For each of the following statements, choose the best answer from the given alternatives and write the letter of your choice in the blank space provided.

_____ 11. If 12 exercise books are divided among three children, each child will get _____ exercise books.

- (A) 2 (B) 3 (C) 4 (D) 6

_____ 12. If one full orange is divided into three equal parts, which one of the following fractions represents two of those parts?

- (A) $\frac{1}{5}$ (B) $\frac{2}{5}$ (C) $\frac{1}{3}$ (D) $\frac{2}{3}$

_____ 13. $3\frac{1}{3}$ is equal to one of the following.

- (A) $\frac{9}{3}$ (B) $\frac{10}{3}$ (C) $\frac{11}{3}$ (D) $\frac{12}{3}$

_____ 14. Ethiopian 50 cents is equal to _____ Ethiopian birr.

- (A) 0.5 birr (B) 0.05 birr (C) 0.2 birr (D) 0.1 birr

_____ 15. Among the following fractions, select the one that is NOT EQUAL to the others.

- (A) $\frac{1}{3}$ (B) 0.5 (C) $\frac{1}{2}$ (D) $\frac{2}{4}$

_____ 16. Simplifying $\frac{12}{18}$ gives _____.

- (A) $\frac{24}{36}$ (B) $\frac{2}{4}$ (C) $\frac{2}{3}$ (D) $\frac{1}{3}$

_____ 17. Which one of the following comparisons of whole numbers is TRUE?

- (A) $105 > 102$ (B) $99 > 105$ (C) $104 < 84$ (D) $35 < 34$

_____ 18. Select the one that puts the numbers in order from the smallest to the largest.

- (A) 14, 17, 16 (B) 15, 18, 16 (C) 16, 21, 18 (D) 15, 17, 19

_____ 19. One big box contains 144 pencils. The pencils are equally divided and put in 12 small packets. How many pencils does each small packet contain?

- (A) 9 (B) 10 (C) 11 (D) 12

_____ 20. The total number of students in one school is 2550. If the number of girls is 1500, what is the number of boys?

- (A) 1000 (B) 1050 (C) 1100 (D) 1150

SHORT-ANSWER ITEMS (5 POINTS)

DIRECTIONS: For each of the following whole numbers, decide the place value of each digit of the whole number and write the appropriate digit of the whole number in the box corresponding its place value.

Whole Number	Place Value				
	Ten Thousands	Thousands	Hundreds	Tens	Ones
24					
294					
42363					

Annex 9

Hamer Woreda Student Statistics (Grades 1-4) (2001 – 2003)

School	Year (E.C.)	Registered			Sat for Exam			Promoted			Failed			Dropped Out			% Wastage		
		M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
Kara Lebuk	2001	47	26	73	44	15	59	44	15	59	–	–	–	3	11	14	6.4	42.3	19.2
	2002	52	44	96	51	44	95	51	44	95	–	–	–	1	–	1	1.9	–	1.0
	2003	59	52	111	59	52	111	59	52	111	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Lela	2001	105	7	112	93	6	99	93	6	99	–	–	–	12	1	13	11.4	14.3	11.6
	2002	99	12	111	96	11	107	96	11	107	–	–	–	3	1	4	3.0	8.3	3.6
	2003	100	10	110	100	10	110	100	10	110	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Cherkaka	2001	83	10	93	83	10	93	83	10	93	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
	2002	79	13	92	79	13	92	79	13	92	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
	2003	59	13	72	59	11	70	59	11	70	–	–	–	2	2	–	15.4	2.8	
Zegerma	2001	57	6	63	57	6	63	57	6	63	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
	2002	50	16	66	45	16	61	41	13	54	4	3	7	5	–	5	18.0	19.0	18.2
	2003	56	16	72	55	16	71	44	9	53	11	7	18	1	–	1	21.4	43.8	26.4
Dambayite	2001	31	8	39	20	8	28	20	8	28	–	–	–	11	–	11	35.5	–	28.2
	2002	35	13	48	35	13	48	35	13	48	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
	2003	39	14	53	37	14	51	37	14	51	–	–	–	2	–	2	5.1	–	3.8
Dimeka	2001	182	136	318	150	132	282	150	132	282	–	–	–	32	4	36	17.6	2.9	11.3
	2002	167	152	319	138	114	252	127	100	227	11	14	25	29	38	67	24.0	34.2	28.8
	2003	188	154	342	183	132	315	183	132	315	–	–	–	5	22	27	2.7	14.3	7.9
Turmi	2001	143	90	233	110	79	189	99	71	170	11	8	19	33	11	44	30.8	21.1	27.0
	2002	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
	2003	134	115	249	119	107	226	119	107	226	–	–	–	15	8	23	11.2	7.0	9.2
Argude	2001	67	10	77	49	10	59	49	10	59	–	–	–	18	–	18	26.9	–	23.4
	2002	59	13	72	55	13	68	55	13	68	–	–	–	4	–	4	6.8	–	5.6
	2003	55	13	68	53	11	64	53	11	64	–	–	–	2	2	4	3.6	15.4	5.9

Table Continued

School	Year (E.C.)	Registered			Sat for Exam			Promoted			Failed			Dropped Out			% Wastage			
		M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	
Boriya	2001	48	23	71	26	6	32	26	6	32	—	—	—	22	17	39	45.8	73.9	54.9	
	2002	36	15	51	36	13	49	36	13	49	—	—	—	—	2	2	—	13.3	3.9	
	2003	30	22	52	29	21	50	29	21	50	—	—	—	1	1	2	3.3	4.5	3.8	
Ershore	2001	95	51	146	63	43	106	63	43	106	—	—	—	32	8	40	33.7	15.7	27.4	
	2002	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	
	2003	100	77	177	95	71	166	95	71	166	—	—	—	5	6	11	5.0	7.8	6.2	
Shanko	2001	84	22	106	78	20	98	78	20	98	—	—	—	6	2	8	7.1	9.1	7.5	
	2002	81	20	101	80	20	100	80	20	100	—	—	—	1	—	1	1.2	—	1.0	
	2003	57	16	73	57	16	73	57	16	73	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	
Achi Algone	2001	102	6	108	102	6	108	102	6	108	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	
	2002	80	5	85	78	5	83	78	5	83	—	—	—	2	—	2	2.5	—	2.4	
	2003	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	
Achi Musa	2001	145	9	154	112	8	120	112	8	120	—	—	—	33	1	34	22.8	11.1	22.1	
	2002	140	8	148	131	8	139	128	8	136	3	—	3	9	—	9	8.6	—	8.1	
	2003	133	12	145	131	12	143	131	12	143	—	—	—	2	—	2	1.5	—	1.4	
Hago	2001	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	
	2002	66	6	72	66	6	72	66	6	72	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	
	2003	123	17	140	121	16	137	121	16	137	—	—	—	2	1	3	1.6	5.9	2.1	

Annex 10

List of Schools in Hamer Woreda

No.	Name of the School	Cycle (Grade Levels)
1	Argude	First (Grades 1-4)
2	Ariya Umbule	First (Grades 1-4)
3	Sambale Hago	First (Grades 1-4)
4	Dambayiti	First (Grades 1-4)
5	Boriya	First (Grades 1-4)
6	Lala	First (Grades 1-4)
7	Achi Algone	First (Grades 1-4)
8	Achi Mussa	First (Grades 1-4)
9	Asle	First (Grades 1-4)
10	Olgan	First (Grades 1-4)
11	Zegerma	First (Grades 1-4)
12	Cherqeqa	First (Grades 1-4)
13	Karo Korme	First (Grades 1-4)
14	Kara Lebok	First (Grades 1-4)
15	Dimeka	Full Primary (Grades 1-8)
16	Shanko	Full Primary (Grades 1-8)
17	Turmi	Full Primary (Grades 1-8)
18	Erbore	Full Primary (Grades 1-8)
19	Kara Dosa	Full Primary (Grades 1-8)
20	Dimeka Millennium	Secondary First Cycle (Grades 9-10)